

Problematic Hadiths on Aqīdah in the Book “Tanya Jawab Agama” Volumes 1–3 by the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid of Muhammadiyah Central Leadership

Saprul Matojir, Universitas Ahmad Dahlan Indonesia

Parjiman, Universitas Ahmad Dahlan Indonesia

Jannatul Husna, Universitas Ahmad Dahlan Indonesia

Correspondence email: saprulmatojir@gmail.com

Abstract

Muhammadiyah as a movement for the purification and modernization of Islam, emphasizes the use of *mutawātir* hadiths in the realm of faith according to the tarjih method. However, many unclear qualities of hadith are still used. This study aims to evaluate the quality of hadith and examine the consistency of the application of the tarjih method in the book. This study was conducted through a qualitative approach, and the type of research is descriptive-analytical with the hadith criticism method, which involves evaluating the consistency of the application of the tarjih principle in each hadith used. The research results indicate that the application of the tarjih methodology in the Tanya Jawab Agama volumes 1-3 regarding hadiths on *aqīdah* is inconsistent, particularly in classifying the quality of the hadiths. It was found that there are three *mutawātir* hadiths, seven *ṣaḥīḥ aḥād* hadith, and three *da'īf* hadiths. Some hadiths are presented only in translation without any explanation of their quality, while others are assessed inconsistently.

Keywords: *Muhammadiyah, Majelis Tarjih, Religious Questions*

Introduction

Muhammadiyah defines itself as an "Islamic movement for promoting good and preventing evil (*amar ma'rūf nahi munkar*) and renewal (*tajdīd*), based on the Qur'an and as-Sunnah, with Islam as its foundation."¹ One of the prominent characteristics of the Muhammadiyah movement is its emphasis on purification and modernization, or

¹ Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta, "Constitution and Bylaws of Muhammadiyah," 2023

what is referred to in Arabic as *tajdīd*. To achieve the objectives of this organization, a special council was established to carry out these tasks, now known as the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid.

The Majelis Tarjih in Muhammadiyah was first established in 1928 as a result of the 16th Muhammadiyah Congress in Pekalongan in 1927. Institutionally, the Majelis Tarjih, complete with its organizational structure and Qaidah Majelis Tarjih, was officially approved during the 17th Muhammadiyah Congress in Yogyakarta in 1928, with KH. Mas Mansur (d. 1365/1946) as its first chairman. From 1995 to 2005, this council was called the Majelis Tarjih and Development of Islamic Thought. However, from 2005 to the present, it has been renamed the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid.²

Based on the study of hadith concerning the paradigm of thought on the equality of Islamic law, Muhammadiyah places greater emphasis on the Qur'an over hadith. The conceptual paradigm of the Majelis Tarjih Muhammadiyah's decisions, which initially relied on the Qur'an and authentic hadith, has shifted to the Qur'an and *sunnah maqbūlah*. *Sunnah maqbūlah* refers to *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic) and *ḥasan* (good) hadith.³ Muhammadiyah's contribution to the study of hadith in Indonesia can be observed through one of its institutions responsible for legal rulings or fatwas, known as the Majelis Tarjih. This institution produces what is referred to as Produk Tarjih, which includes decisions (*putusan*), fatwas (*fatwa*), and discourses (*wacana*).⁴

The book "Tanya Jawab Agama" is a written work that compiles various questions submitted by Muhammadiyah members and Muslims in general regarding religious issues. These questions were featured in the Suara Muhammadiyah magazine from 1986 to 1989.⁵ Various issues raised by the community were periodically addressed by the Religious Fatwa Team of the Majelis Tarjih. The first book was published in 1990, followed by the second volume, and subsequently up to eight volumes to date.

² M. Hidayat Ediz, Yecki Bus, "Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid as the Authority of Fatwas in Muhammadiyah," dalam Jurnal Al-Ahkam Vol. XXI Nomor 1, Juni 2020

³ Zainal Abidin, "The Contribution of Muhammadiyah in Hadith Studies in Indonesia", dalam Jurnal Sarwah, Vol. 15, No. 2, 2016"

⁴ Tim Majelis Tarjih dan Tajdid PP Muhammadiyah, *Tanya Jawab Agama 5*, 7th Edition, (Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2013)

⁵ Tim Majelis Tarjih dan Tajdid PP Muhammadiyah, *Tanya Jawab Agama 1*, 7th Edition, (Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2013)

The PP Muhammadiyah Majelis Tarjih team, in writing “Tanya Jawab Agama”, extensively uses hadith to support their arguments. In the first volume alone, over a hundred hadiths are cited, followed by more than 150 in the second volume, and over 100 in the third. However, the citation methods often vary between volumes, and even within different chapters of the same volume, different citation methods are employed. Many hadiths are not explicitly assessed for their authenticity, with some being presented only in translation without providing their original sources. The quality of the hadiths is only explained in a limited number of cases. This inconsistency raises significant concerns, especially considering that “Tanya Jawab Agama” serves as a religious guide for Muhammadiyah members. The issue of authenticity and methodological rigor in citing hadiths requires further critical evaluation to ensure the reliability of this important resource.

The selection of the topic of *aqidah* also serves as a response to the classic debate among Muhammadiyah members, who have been divided in their claims that Muhammadiyah's *aqidah* aligns more closely with *asy'ariyyah*.⁶ Another faction argues that Muhammadiyah's *aqidah* is closer to *salafī* or *Aṣariyah* beliefs. Therefore, this research aims to provide a more holistic understanding, shedding light on the *aqidah* perspective adopted by the Majelis Tarjih Muhammadiyah and its position in addressing the polemics surrounding *aqidah* interpretations that are prevalent in society.

Therefore, in this research, the author intends to examine the hadiths used in Tanya Jawab Agama Volumes 1–3, focusing specifically on issues related to *aqidah*. Given that Muhammadiyah, in the core formulation of its *manhaj tarjih*, firmly asserts the use of only *mutawātir* (authentic and widely transmitted) hadiths in matters of *aqidah*, this study will be limited to analyzing those hadiths.⁷ It would certainly be an interesting discussion to dissect each hadith found in Tanya Jawab Agama Volumes 1–3 in order to examine and critique the consistency of the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid PP Muhammadiyah in implementing the *Manhaj Tarjih* they have adhered to over time.

⁶ Ilham, “There is No Need to Clash Asy'ariyah and Atsariyah,” 2021, <https://muhammadiyah.or.id/2021/12/tidak-perlu-membenturkan-asyariyah-dan-atsariyah/>.

⁷ Asjmuni Abdurrahman, “Manhaj Tarjih Muhammadiyah”, Pustaka Pelajar, Yogyakarta, 2012, hal. 13, 199; Tim PP Muhammadiyah Majelis Tarjih, *Himpunan Putusan Tarjih Muhammadiyah* (Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2019).

This research uses a qualitative method with a descriptive-analytical approach based on library research⁸. The data for this study consist of primary sources in the form of hadiths included in Tanya Jawab Agama Muhammadiyah Volumes 1–3, as well as secondary sources, such as books, texts, articles, and relevant academic literature to support the analysis. Data collection techniques involve document study, which includes searching for and analyzing various literatures, both primary and secondary sources, that are relevant to the research.

The collected data will be analyzed descriptively using the *Takhrīj al-Ḥadīṣ* method, referring to the approach of Syuhudi Ismail in his works, such as “Cara Praktis Mencari Hadis: Metodologi Penelitian Hadis Nabi, and Kaidah Kesahihan Sanad Hadis.” The hadiths will be traced through index books such as *Mu’jam al-Mufahras li Alfāḥ al-Ḥadīṣ*, *Mausū’ah Aṭrāf al-Ḥadīṣ*, and *Al-Jāmi’ al-Ṣagīr*. To facilitate the analysis process, the researcher will also utilize digital applications such as *Maktabah Syāmilah* and *Mausu’ah* software while still referring to the original texts. During the analysis, the researcher will conduct *i’tibār sanad* (critical examination of the chain of narration), examine each narrator in the hadith, and determine the authenticity grade of the hadith used.

History of Books

The book “Tanya Jawab Agama Muhammadiyah” is a work aimed at providing Muslims with practical guidance to understand Islamic teachings in a simple, practical way, based on the unique approach of Muhammadiyah. The goal of this book is to address various religious issues that arise in daily life, which often require clear and practical understanding. This is closely aligned with the objectives of Muhammadiyah. Since its founding, Muhammadiyah has been committed to purifying and modernizing Islamic teachings in accordance with the development of the times, while steadfastly adhering to the principles of the Qur'an and Sunnah.⁹

The purpose of this book is to ensure that Muslims gain an understanding that aligns with reality, without neglecting the fundamental teachings from the sources of religion. Additionally, this book emphasizes the effort to harmonize religious

⁸ John W. Crestwell, *Research Design (5Th Edition)* (London: Sage Publications, 2018).

⁹ Muhammad Hazmi et al., *Ideologi Muhammadiyah* (Jember: Universitas Muhammadiyah Jember, 2019).

understanding with common sense and universal human values, in accordance with the principles of *tajdid* (renewal) championed by Muhammadiyah.¹⁰

This book was first published as a result of the efforts of its editors, discussed by Asjmuni Abdurrahman from the Majelis Tarjih PP Muhammadiyah and Moeljadi from “The Suara Muhammadiyah”h editorial team. As part of the Tanya Jawab/Fatwa Agama column in the Suara Muhammadiyah magazine, this book contains a collection of answers to religious issues addressed by the Majelis Tarjih PP Muhammadiyah team.¹¹

The column was supervised by the Majelis Tarjih PP Muhammadiyah team, which included Asymuni Abdurrahman, Djoewaeni, and M. Jandra, under the guidance of Ahmad Azhar Basyir, the Chairman of Majelis Tarjih PP Muhammadiyah. Over the course of five years under Muhammadiyah's leadership, this team underwent several changes. “Tanya Jawab Agama” book contains a collection of religious questions published in the “Suara Muhammadiyah” magazine since 1986. The first volume of Buku “Tanya Jawab Agama” was initially published in 1990, followed by the release of Volume II, Volume III, and continuing up to Volume VII.

Systematics of Writing

The book “Tanya Jawab Agama” consists of several separate chapters that classify religious issues, covering various topics divided into key themes related to the daily lives of Muslims. These themes include aqīdah (faith), ibadah (worship), muamalah (transactions), and modern issues requiring a religious perspective, such as matters of health, family, and economy. Each new volume may introduce new chapters depending on the questions that address contemporary issues arising in society. As previously explained, Buku Tanya Jawab Agama is essentially a compilation of the Tanya Jawab Agama column from the Suara Muhammadiyah magazines, which were collected and bound into a single book. Each issue is presented in the form of a question and answer.

The first section begins by presenting the question from the inquirer, along with information about the source of the question. The second section contains the answer

¹⁰ Ahmad Syafii Ma'arif et al., *Tajdid Muhammadiyah For Civilization Enlightenment* (Yogyakarta: UAD Press, 2006).

¹¹ Tim PP Muhammadiyah Majelis Tarjih, *Tanya Jawab Agama 1* (Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2003).

to the posed question. In answering the issues presented, the writing team starts with a brief introduction to the issue or question, providing background information to clarify the inquiry. Afterward, they present the religious evidence and arguments that serve as the foundation, including relevant verses from the Qur'an and related hadiths, along with an explanation of their context. This structure is effective in providing detailed guidance and making it easier for readers to understand the legal basis and its practical applications.

Manhāj Tarjih

Linguistically, "manhaj tarjih" means the method or approach in tarjih. In *uṣūl fiqh*, tarjih is the effort to evaluate the strength of *dalīl-dalīl syar'ī* (Islamic legal proofs) that appear to contradict each other or to assess legal views to determine which one is stronger.¹² Al-Razi defines tarjih as "strengthening one dalil over another so that the stronger one is known, after which the stronger one is practiced and the weaker one is abandoned."¹³ This means tarjih is performed by a mujtahid and only applies to dalils that seem to contradict each other. However, this definition is considered limited, as tarjih can also be applied to methods of argumentation, differing *qaūl* (opinions) in fiqh, and conflicting narrations of imams. For example, Ibn Qudamah performed tarjih on two differing views of Imam Ahmad regarding the ruling on breaking fast for a traveler in the middle of Ramadan.¹⁴

Initially, Muhammadiyah understood tarjih according to this classical definition, which involved comparing the opinions of scholars to choose the strongest in terms of evidence. However, as the organization developed, Muhammadiyah expanded the meaning of tarjih. Through the Majelis Tarjih, tarjih in Muhammadiyah is not only about selecting between existing dalils, but also about engaging in ijtihad to address contemporary issues that have not been answered by classical fuqaha.¹⁵ Tarjih in Muhammadiyah is not limited to ijtihad in the field of law but also includes social and humanitarian issues from an Islamic perspective.

¹² Syamsul Anwar, *Manhaj Tarjih Muhammadiyah* (Yogyakarta: Panitia Musyawarah Nasional Tarjih Muhammadiyah XXX, 2018). p. 6

¹³ Fahr Al-Din Al-Razi, "Al-Mahshul Fi Ilm Ushul Al-Fiqh" (Beirut: Mu'assasah Ar-Risalah, 2008). Jilid 5 p. 397

¹⁴ Ibnu Qudamah, "Al-Mughni" (Riyadh: Dar Alam al-Kutub, 1997). Vol 3 pp345-347.

¹⁵ Anwar, *Manhaj Tarjih Muhammadiyah*. p. 9.

In Muhammadiyah, tarjih is an activity that is almost identical to ijtihad, where every social or religious issue is addressed through the perspective of Islam. This method of tarjih uses a system that includes sources, approaches, technical procedures, and certain principles to support tarjih activities in a systematic way. Thus, tarjih involves a normative response to problems (*das sollen*), while still allowing space for critical and analytical thinking that considers empirical reality (*das sein*).¹⁶

Most of the products of the Majelis Tarjih Muhammadiyah are in the form of normative guidelines and fatwas, aimed at providing direction for the Muslim community. This aligns with the function of Majelis Tarjih as an institution that studies Islamic teachings to provide guidance and direction for the community. In the Tarjih Decision of Muhammadiyah in the year 2000, it is stated that ijtihad is carried out through an integrated approach of *bayānī* (textual evidence), *burhānī* (rational argumentation), and *'irfānī* (mystical or spiritual insight).¹⁷

The *bayānī* approach prioritizes references from the *naṣ* (texts of Shariah), particularly from the Qur'an and Sunnah, especially in matters of ibadah *maḥḍah* (ritual worship). The *burhānī* approach involves knowledge, such as astronomy in determining the beginning of the Hijri month. The *'irfānī* approach relies on intuition gained from spiritual insight and the purification of the soul, adding a dimension of moral sensitivity in decision-making. These three approaches do not stand alone but are used in a circular and complementary manner, as needed, within the framework of *maqāṣid syarī'ah* (the objectives of Islamic law) to maintain relevance and depth in addressing religious issues.

Hadith in The View of Muhammadiyah

It is stated in the “Matan Keyakinan dan Cita-cita Hidup Muhammadiyah”, in the third point, that Muhammadiyah practices Islam based on: a) the Qur'an, the book of Allah revealed to the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), and b) the Sunnah of the Prophet, the explanation and implementation of the teachings of the Qur'an given by the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), using reason in accordance with the spirit of Islamic teachings.¹⁸

¹⁶ *Ibid.* p. 10.

¹⁷ *Ibid.* p. 25-27.

¹⁸ Ahmad Jais, “The Text of Belief and Life Aspirations of Muhammadiyah,” *Al-Hikmah* 8, no. 1 (1986): 63–71, <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24260/al-hikmah.v8i1.72>.

From the explanation provided, it is clear that Muhammadiyah considers the Sunnah as an essential pillar in practicing the religion. In Muhammadiyah, the Sunnah is regarded as everything originating from the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) that should be emulated, as stated in the Preamble of the Muhammadiyah Statutes, the Personality of Muhammadiyah, and the “Matan Keyakinan dan Cita-cita Hidup Muhammadiyah.” This understanding aligns closely with the view of the muhaddithin (scholars of hadith), which includes the characteristics of the Prophet as part of the Sunnah.¹⁹

Ḥadīṣ Aḥād as The Basic of Aqīdah in The View of Muhammadiyah

Hadith is classified into two types: *mutawātir* and *āḥād*. *Mutawātir* refers to a hadith that is narrated continuously by many people, thus providing certainty.²⁰ On the other hand, *āḥād* does not reach this level, and its credibility in providing certainty remains debated. Some scholars believe that Ahad hadith can be used in all aspects of religion, including *aqīdah* (faith), while others reject its use in *aqīdah* because it is considered less convincing.

In the context of Muhammadiyah, the second opinion is more widely accepted, leading to the conclusion that *aqīdah* must be based only on *mutawātir* hadith. This stance was established during the 18th Muhammadiyah Special Congress in Solo in 1929 and was further reinforced by the Majelis Tarjih in the 1985–1990 period, which declared that only Mutawatir hadith should be used in matters of *aqīdah*.²¹ The purpose of this stance is to prevent Muhammadiyah members from adopting unclear or contradictory beliefs.

In this study, the author seeks to critique the hadiths used by the authors of the “Tanya Jawab Agama” book in the chapter on *aqīdah*, specifically examining the consistency of using *mutawātir* hadith in matters of *aqīdah*. The research will explore the quality of these hadiths, determining whether they are *mutawātir*, *āḥād*, or possibly even weak (*ḍaʿīf*) hadith.

¹⁹ Kasman, *Hadith in Muhammadiyah's Perspective* (Yogyakarta: Mitra Pustaka, 2012). P. 86-100.

²⁰ Maḥmūd al-Ṭaḥḥān, *Taisīr Muṣṭalāḥ Al-Ḥadīth* (Riyadh: Maktabah Al-Maʿarif, 2011). P. 23.

²¹ Kasman, *Hadith in Muhammadiyah's Perspective*. P. 101-119.

Takhrij al-Ḥadīṣ

1. First Hadith

أَيُّهَا النَّاسُ، إِنِّي مَا أَمُرُّكُمْ إِلَّا بِمَا أَمَرَكُمُ اللَّهُ بِهِ، وَلَا أَهْأَكُمُ إِلَّا عَمَّا هَأَكُمُ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ

O mankind, indeed I do not command you except with what Allah has commanded you, and I do not forbid you except from what Allah has forbidden you. (HR. Al-Ṭabranī)

After conducting the *takhrij* in the *Mu'jam al-Kabīr*, this hadith was found in volume 3, page 84, no. 2737. In terms of the *sanad*'s quantity, the hadith is considered *garīb* because it is only found in a single chain from al-Ṭabranī. In terms of the quality of the *sanad*, it is *mursal*, as there is a break in the chain after Ḥasan bin al-Ḥasan. Out of the narrators, only four are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy and precise), while two are *ḍa'īf* (weak) and two are *majhūl* (unknown). Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ḍa'īf*.

2. Second Hadith

مَا أَنَا أَخْرِجُكُمْ مِنْ قَبْلِ نَفْسِي، وَلَا أَنَا تَرَكْتُهُ، وَلَكِنَّ اللَّهَ أَخْرَجَكُمْ وَتَرَكْتُهُ، إِنَّمَا أَنَا عَبْدٌ مَأْمُورٌ مَا أُمِرْتُ بِهِ فَعَلْتُ « {إِنْ أَتْبَعُ إِلَّا مَا يُوحَى إِلَيَّ} »

I do not bring forth anything to you from myself, nor do I leave anything behind. It is only Allah the Almighty who brings forth to you and leaves it behind, for I am nothing but a servant who is commanded. Whatever has been commanded to me, I carry out. I only follow what my Lord has obligated upon me. (HR. At-Ṭabranī from Ibn 'Abbās).

Regarding the *takhrij*: The hadith was found in the following sources: *Mustadrāk al-Ḥākim* Volume 3, page 116; *Mu'jam al-Kabīr* Volume 12, page 147; *Majma' al-Zawā'id* Volume 9, page 115; *Kanzu al-'Ummāl* 32887. In terms of the *sanad* quantity, the hadith is classified as *azīz* because it has only two chains from al-Ḥakim and al-Ṭabranī. In terms of the quality of the *sanad*, it was found that the chain from al-Ḥakim contains five *ṣiqah* (reliable) narrators, two *ṣadūq* (truthful) narrators, and one *ḍa'īf* (weak) narrator, while the chain from al-Ṭabranī contains three *ṣiqah* narrators, five *ḍa'īf* narrators, and one *majhūl* (unknown) narrator. Therefore, the quality of this hadith is considered *ḍa'īf* (weak).

3. Third Hadith

كَانَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ إِذَا خَرَجَ مَسِيرَةً ثَلَاثَةَ أَمْيَالٍ أَوْ ثَلَاثَةَ فَرَاسِخَ صَلَّى رَكْعَتَيْنِ

The Messenger of Allah when traveling a distance of 3 miles or a farsakh, performed a shortened prayer (qasar) of two rak'ahs." (HR. Muslim from Anas) (HR Muslim dari Anas) Note: 1 mile is approximately 1609 meters, so 3 miles equals around 4.8 km.

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, in the chapter of Salat for travelers, bab 1 no 12; *Sunan Abū Dāwud* no 1201; *Musnad Aḥmad*, vol. 3, p. 129; *Syarḥ al-Sunnah al-Baghawī*, vol. 4, p. 171; *Muṣannaf Ibnu Abī Syaibah*, vol. 2, p. 443.

In terms of the quantity of the sanad, this hadith is *garīb* because it has only one narrator. In terms of the quality of the *sanad*, it is *muttaṣil* (unbroken), as there is no interruption in the chain of narration. All the narrators are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy) without any defects. Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic). This explains the methodology of evaluating the hadith's sanad (chain of narration) and its authenticity based on the source references you provided.

4. Fourth Hadith

قال فأخبرني عن الإيمان قال أن تؤمن بالله و ملائكته وكتبه ورسله واليوم الآخر و تؤمن بالقدر خيره وشره (الحديث رواه البخاري و مسلم)

Jibril (who appeared in the form of a man) said, 'Tell me about faith (iman).' The Prophet (peace be upon him) replied: 'You must believe (have certainty) in Allah, His Angels, His Messengers, the Last Day, and the Divine Decree, both the good and the bad of it.' He (Jibril) said, 'You have spoken the truth, O Muhammad.... etc

After conducting the takhrīj, the hadith was found in the following sources: *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, Book of Iman, pages 34 and 37; Book of Shahada, page 26; Book of Tafsir Surah 31, page 2. *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Book of Iman, pages 5, 7, and 8. *Sunan Abī Dāwud*, Book of Sunnah, page 16. *Sunan al-Tirmizī*, Book of Iman, page 4. *Sunan al-Nasāī*, Book of Iman, pages 5 and 6; Book of Salat, page 4. *Sunan Ibnu Mājah*, Book of Mukaddimah, pages 9 and 10. *Musnad Aḥmad*, Volume 1, pages 27, 52, 162, and 319; Volume 2, pages 107 and 426; Volume 4, pages 129, 164, 385, and 446; Volume 5, page 3. After further investigation in the book *Naẓm al-Mutanāsir*, the hadith was found as the thirteenth hadith and it is confirmed to be in the category of *mutawātir*.

5. Fifth Hadith

قَالَ: «أَتَدْرُونَ مَا الْإِيمَانُ بِاللَّهِ وَحْدَهُ» قَالُوا: اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ أَعْلَمُ، قَالَ: «شَهَادَةُ أَنْ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ وَأَنَّ مُحَمَّدًا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ، وَإِقَامُ الصَّلَاةِ، وَإِيتَاءُ الزَّكَاةِ، وَصِيَامُ رَمَضَانَ، (رواه البخاري)

The Prophet said: "Do you know about faith in Allah itself?" They replied, "Allah and His Messenger know better." The Prophet said, "Bear witness that there is no god but Allah, and bear witness that Muhammad is the Messenger of Allah, establish prayer, pay zakat, and fast during Ramadan... (and so on)."

After conducting the takhrīj, the hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥiḥ al-Bukhārī*, book 1, no. 21, *Musnad Aḥmad*, volume 1, page 228, *Sunan al-Kubrā al-Baihaqī*, book 1, no. 13, book 6, no. 294. Upon reviewing it in the book *Naẓm al-Mutanāṣir*, the hadith was found as hadith number thirteen, and it can be confirmed that this hadith falls into the category of mutawatir in meaning, similar to hadith number four.²²

6. Sixth Hadith

قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: «مَنْ كَانَ يُؤْمِنُ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ فَلَا يُؤْذِي جَارَهُ، وَمَنْ كَانَ يُؤْمِنُ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ فَلْيُكْرِمْ ضَيْفَهُ، وَمَنْ كَانَ يُؤْمِنُ بِاللَّهِ وَالْيَوْمِ الْآخِرِ فَلْيُكْمِلْ خَيْرًا أَوْ لِيَسْكُتْ (رواه البخاري و مسلم)

"The Messenger of Allah (saw) said: 'Whoever believes in Allah and the Last Day should not harm his neighbor; whoever believes in Allah and the Last Day should honor his guest; and whoever believes in Allah and the Last Day should speak good or remain silent.'

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥiḥ al-Bukhārī*, Book of Manners, pages 21 and 85; Book of Raqāq, page 22. *Ṣaḥiḥ Muslim*, Book of Faith, pages 74, 75, 77; Book of Luqāṭah, page 14. *Sunan Abī Dāwūd*, Book of Manners, page 122. *Sunan al-Tirmizī*, Book of Birr, page 42; Book of Qiyāmah, page 50. *Sunan Ibnu Mājah*, Book of Fitnah, page 12. *Sunan al-Dārimī*, Book of Food, page 11. *Musnad Aḥmad*, Vol. 5, pages 247, 412.

In terms of the number of chains (sanad), this hadith is *mashyūr* (well-known). As for the quality, its sanad is *muttaṣil* (uninterrupted), as there is no break in the chain of transmission. All the narrators are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy), except in the chain from Ahmad, where there are two weak narrators, namely ‘Abdullāh bin Lahī‘ah and Ḥuyay

²² Muḥammad ibn Abī al-Fayḍ Ja‘far ibn Idrīs al-Ḥasanī al-Idrīsī Al-Kattānī, “Naẓm Al-Mutanāthir Min Al-Ḥadīth Al-Mutawātir” (Mesir: Dzat al-Faharis al-Ilmiyyah, 1345). P. 42.

bin 'Abdullāh. However, the hadith has been strengthened through other chains. Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic).

7. Seventh Hadith

قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ لِأَبِي طَالِبٍ: " يَا عَمَّ، قُلْ: لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ، كَلِمَةً أَشْهَدُ لَكَ بِهَا عِنْدَ اللَّهِ (رواه البخاري و مسلم)

The Messenger of Allah (saw) said to Abu Talib: 'O Uncle, say 'Laa Ilaaha Illallah' (There is no god but Allah), a phrase that will serve as a testimony for you before Allah.

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, Book of Funerals, page 81; Book of the Virtues of the Ansar, page 40; Book of Oaths, page 19. *Ṣaḥīḥ Muslim*, Book of Faith, page 39. *Sunan al-Nasāī*, Book of Funerals, page 102. *Musnad Aḥmad*, Vol. 5, page 433.

In terms of the number of chains (sanad), this hadith is *gharīb* (rare), as it is only found through a single chain from al-Musayyib. As for the quality, its sanad is *muttaṣil* (uninterrupted), meaning there is no break in the chain of transmission. All the narrators in each chain are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy). Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic).

8. Eighth Hadith

قَالَ النَّبِيُّ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ: «لَا يَزْنِي الرَّأْيِي حِينَ يَزْنِي وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ، وَلَا يَشْرِبُ الْخَمْرَ حِينَ يَشْرِبُ وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ، وَلَا يَسْرِقُ حِينَ يَسْرِقُ وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ، وَلَا يَنْتَهَبُ خُبْرَةً، يَرْفَعُ النَّاسُ إِلَيْهِ فِيهَا أَبْصَارَهُمْ حِينَ يَنْتَهَبُهَا وَهُوَ مُؤْمِنٌ (رواه البخاري و مسلم)

The Prophet (saw) said: 'A person does not commit adultery while he is a believer, and a person does not drink alcohol while he is drinking it in a state of faith, and a person does not steal while he is stealing in a state of faith.' And Bukhari added in another narration: 'And a person does not rob a valuable item that people would gape at, while he is robbing it in a state of faith.'

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Sunan Ibnu Mājah*, Book of Trials, Vol. 3. In terms of the number of chains (sanad), this hadith is *garīb* (rare), as it is only found through a single chain from Abu Hurairah. In terms of quality, its sanad is *muttaṣil* (uninterrupted), meaning there is no break in the chain of transmission. All the narrators in each chain are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy). Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic).

9. Ninth Hadith

إِنَّ الْإِيمَانَ لَيَخْلُقُ فِي جَوْفِ أَحَدِكُمْ كَمَا يَخْلُقُ الثَّوبُ الْخَلْقُ؛ فَسَأَلُوا اللَّهَ أَنْ يُجَدِّدَ الْإِيمَانَ فِي قُلُوبِكُمْ (رواه الطبراني والحاكم عن ابن عمر)

Indeed, faith can wear out in you just as clothing wears out. Therefore, ask Allah to renew the faith in your hearts. (Reported by Al-Ṭabranī, Al-Ḥākim from Ibn 'Amr with a ḥasan (good) rating).

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Mu'jam al-Kabīr al-Ṭabranī*, Volume 13, page 36, no. 84 *Mustadrak al-Ḥākim*, Volume 1, page 4, *Majma' al-Zawā'id*, Volume 1, page 52. *Kanzu al-'Ummāl*, no. 1313. *Jam'u al-Jawāmi'*, page 5405. In terms of the quantity of the sanad, this hadith is *garīb* (rare), as it is found through only one chain from Abdullah bin 'Amr bin al-Ash. In terms of the quality of the sanad, it is *muttaṣīl* (uninterrupted), as there is no break in the chain of transmission. All the narrators in the chain from al-Ṭabranī are *siqah* (trustworthy), whereas in the chain from al-Ḥākim, there is one problematic narrator, Muhammad bin Ismail bin Mihran. However, this issue is mitigated by the chain from al-Ṭabranī. Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ṣaḥīḥ* (authentic).

10. Tenth Hadith

جَدِّدُوا إِيمَانَكُمْ ، قِيلَ: يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ، وَكَيْفَ تُجَدِّدُ إِيمَانَنَا؟ قَالَ: " أَكْثِرُوا مِنْ قَوْلِ لَا إِلَهَ إِلَّا اللَّهُ (رواه أحمد بإسناد حسن)
Renew your faith, all of you." Some people asked, "How can we renew our faith, O Messenger of Allah?" The Prophet replied: "Increase the recitation of 'Lā ilāha illā llāh'." (Reported by Ahmad with a good sanad).

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Musnad Aḥmad*, Volume 2, page 259. In terms of the quantity of the sanad, this hadith is *garīb* (rare), as it is found through only one chain from Abu Hurairah. In terms of the quality of the sanad, upon further examination, there is a weak narrator, namely Sadaqah bin Musa. Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *ḍa'īf* (weak).

11. eleventh Hadith

عن فضالة بن عبيد، يقول: سمع النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم رجلاً يدعو في صلاته فلم يُصَلِّ على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، فقال النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم: «عجل هذا»، ثم دعاه فقال له أو لغيره: «إذا صلى أحدكم فليبدأ بتحميد الله والثناء عليه، ثم ليُصَلِّ على النبي صلى الله عليه وسلم، ثم ليُدْعُ بعد بما شاء» (رواه الترمذي)

It was narrated from Fudlalah bin 'Ubaid (RA), who said: 'The Messenger of Allah (SAW) heard someone making a supplication during their prayer without sending blessings upon the Prophet. The Prophet said: 'This person is hastening.' After that, the Prophet called the person and said to him, or to another person: 'When someone prays (and makes a supplication), they should begin their prayer by praising and exalting Allah, then send blessings upon the Prophet. After that, they may pray for whatever they desire.' (Reported by At-Tirmidhi, who declared it authentic)

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Sunan al-Tirmidhi*, Book of Supplications, page 64. *Musnad Ahmad*, Volume 6, page 18.

In terms of the quantity of the sanad, this hadith is *garīb* (rare), as it is found through only one chain from Fadalāh bin Ubaid. In terms of the quality of the sanad, it is muttasil (unbroken) because there is no interruption in the chain of narration. All of the narrators are *ṣiqah* (trustworthy). Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *sahih* (authentic).

12. Twelfth Hadith

عَنْ أَبِي مَسْعُودٍ الْأَنْصَارِيِّ أَنَّهُ قَالَ: أَتَانَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ فِي مَجْلِسِ سَعْدِ بْنِ عُבَادَةَ فَقَالَ لَهُ بَشِيرُ بْنُ سَعْدٍ: أَمَرَنَا اللَّهُ أَنْ نُصَلِّيَ عَلَيْكَ يَا رَسُولَ اللَّهِ فَكَيْفَ نُصَلِّيُ عَلَيْكَ؟ قَالَ: فَسَكَتَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ حَتَّى تَمْتَنِينَا أَنَّهُ لَمْ يَسْأَلْهُ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: قُولُوا: "اللَّهُمَّ صَلِّ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَلَى آلِ مُحَمَّدٍ كَمَا صَلَّيْتَ عَلَى إِبْرَاهِيمَ، وَبَارِكْ عَلَى مُحَمَّدٍ وَعَلَى آلِ مُحَمَّدٍ كَمَا بَارَكْتَ عَلَى آلِ إِبْرَاهِيمَ فِي الْعَالَمِينَ إِنَّكَ حَمِيدٌ مُجِيدٌ، وَالسَّلَامُ كَمَا قَدْ عَلِمْتُمْ (رواه أحمد و مسلم والنسائي والترمذي)

It was narrated from Ibn Mas'ud (RA), who said: 'The Messenger of Allah (SAW) came to us while we were sitting in the assembly of Sa'ad bin 'Ubaidah. Then, Bashir bin Sa'ad asked the Prophet: 'O Messenger of Allah, Allah has commanded us to send blessings upon you. How should we send blessings upon you?' The Prophet remained silent and did not answer. We thought it was best not to ask this question. Then the Prophet replied: 'Say: 'Allahumma ṣalli 'Alā Muḥammad wa 'Alā āli Muḥammad' and so on, until you say: 'Innaka ḥamīdum Majīd.' As for sending peace (salam), as you know it.' (Reported by Ahmad, Muslim, An-Nasa'i, and At-Tirmidhi).

After conducting takhrīj, this hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥīḥ al-Bukhārī*, Book of Tafsir Surah 22, page 10, Book of Prophets, page 10, Book of Supplications, pages 21,

22. *Ṣaḥiḥ Muslim*, Book of Prayer, pages 65, 66, 69. *Sunan Abī Dāwud*, Book of Prayer, page 179. *Sunan al-Tirmizī*, Tafsir Surah 22, page 10, Book of Witr, page 20. *Sunan al-Nasāī*, Book of Forgetfulness in Prayer, pages 49, 50-54. *Sunan al-Dārimī*, Book of Prayer, page 85. *Muwāṭa' Malik*, Book of Travel, pages 66, 67. *Musnad Aḥmad*, Volume 1, page 162, Volume 2, page 47, Volume 4, pages 118, 241, 243, 244, Volume 5, pages 274, 374, 424. After investigating the *Nadhm al-Mutanatsir*, this hadith is listed as hadith number 78, and it is confirmed that this hadith falls under the category of *mutawātir* (widely transmitted).²³

13. Thirteenth Hadith

السَّيِّدُ اللَّهُ (رواه أحمد وأبو داود)

The Sayyid (Master) is Allah. (Reported by Ahmad and Abu Dawud).

After conducting *takhrīj*, this hadith was found in: *Ṣaḥiḥ al-Bukhārī*, Book of the Virtues of the Companions of the Prophet, page 5. *Sunan Abī Dāwud*, Book of Manners, page 9. *Musnad Aḥmad*, Volume 4, pages 24, 25. From the perspective of the quantity of the sanad (chain of narration), this hadith is *garīb* (rare), as it only has one chain from Abdullah bin Shakheer. In terms of quality, the sanad is *muttaṣil* (unbroken), as there is no interruption in the chain of narration. All narrators in the chain are considered *ṣiqah* (trustworthy). Therefore, the quality of this hadith is *sahih* (authentic).

Consistency in the implementation of *Manhaj Tarjih*

In terms of determining the hadiths related to theology, Muhammadiyah tends to follow the thinking of reformers like Muhammad Abduh. Muhammadiyah holds that even though a hadith is *ṣaḥiḥ* (authentic), a hadith classified as *āḥād* (reported by a single narrator) cannot be used as a basis for theological matters.²⁴ This principle has significant consequences, as Muhammadiyah is considered very strict on this matter. It seems to leave no room for even *sahih āḥād* hadiths.

From volumes one to three, the author found 13 hadiths used as evidence by the Majelis Tarjih team as the basis for their fatwas. Out of these 15 hadiths, the researcher only found three that were of *mutawātir* (massively transmitted) grade, while the

²³ Al-Kattānī. P. 96.

²⁴ Kasman, *Hadith in Muhammadiyah's Perspective*. P. 384.

remaining 10, despite being classified as *ṣaḥīḥ*, were not *mutawātir*, and three of them were even considered weak in terms of quality.

The *āḥād* hadiths found in the chapter on theology by the author serve as evidence of the inconsistency of the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid in applying the principles of hadith related to theology in their fatwas. The apparent weakness, according to the author's assumption, is caused by several factors:

1. The lack of independent research by Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid in evaluating hadith quality. This can be seen from their citations in writing sources and evaluating the quality of hadiths, where most hadiths still rely on the assessments of hadith critics who often fail to provide clear reasons for declaring a hadith as *sahih* or *dhaif* (weak).²⁵
2. The references available in society at that time were mostly dominated by *fiqh* (Islamic jurisprudence) books.²⁶ Although it cannot be denied that hadith books were also circulating, most of them were secondary hadith collections.

The lack of supervision in the implementation of the core principles of *manhaj tarjih* (methodology of preference). In fact, differences or inconsistencies in methodology can be found in the books. For example, in the second volume, it is explained that the importance of *qaṭ'ī* (definitive) evidence from the Qur'an and *mutawātir* hadiths is essential in explaining theological matters.²⁷ However, in many cases, *āḥād* hadiths are used.

Conclusion

Based on the results of the research that have been examined in depth, the author concludes as follows: *first*, in the book "Tanya Jawab Agama" by the Majelis Tarjih and Tajdid Muhammadiyah, specifically in the chapters on theology from volumes 1 to 3, there are 13 hadiths used as references. Of this total, there are 3 *mutawātir* (authentic, transmitted by a large number of narrators) hadiths, 7 *ṣaḥīḥ* (sound) *āḥād* (single-source) hadiths, and 3 *ḍa'īf* (weak) *āḥād* hadiths. These hadiths

²⁵ Tarjih, *Tanya Jawab Agama 1*. P. 48

²⁶ Kasman, *Hadith in Muhammadiyah's Perspective*. P. 396

²⁷ Tim PP Muhammadiyah Majelis Tarjih, *Tanya Jawab Agama 2* (Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2003). P. 1.

serve as the basis for the arguments in the theological discussions presented in the book.

Second, in answering various theological issues, several inconsistencies were found in the application of *mutawātir* hadiths as the primary foundation. These inconsistencies highlight the need for a re-evaluation of the method for selecting and using *mutawātir* hadiths, particularly in theological discussions that require a high level of validity. This is an important note to improve the quality of the discussions in the book.

References

- Al-Kattānī, Muḥammad ibn Abī al-Fayḍ Ja'far ibn Idrīs al-Ḥasanī al-Idrīsī. "Naẓm Al-Mutanāthir Min Al-Ḥadīth Al-Mutawātir." Mesir: Dzat al-Faharis al-Ilmiyyah, 1345.
- Al-Razi, Fahr Al-Din. "Al-Mahshul Fi Ilm Ushul Al-Fiqh." Beirut: Mu'assasah Ar-Risalah, 2008.
- al-Ṭaḥḥān, Maḥmūd. *Taisīr Muṣṭalāḥ Al-Ḥadīth*. Riyadh: Maktabah Al-Ma'arif, 2011.
- Anwar, Syamsul. *Manhaj Tarjih Muhammadiyah*. Yogyakarta: Panitia Musyawarah Nasional Tarjih Muhammadiyah XXX, 2018.
- Crestwell, John W. *Research Design (5Th Edition)*. London: Sage Publications, 2018.
- Hazmi, Muhammad, Dhian Wahana Putra, Amri Gunasti, and Abdul Jalil. *Ideologi Muhammadiyah*. Jember: Universitas Muhammadiyah Jember, 2019.
- Ilham. "Tidak Perlu Membenturkan Asy'ariyah Dan Atsariyah," 2021. <https://muhammadiyah.or.id/2021/12/tidak-perlu-membenturkan-asyariyah-dan-atsariyah/>.
- Jais, Ahmad. "Matan Keyakinan Dan Cita-Cita Hidup Muhammadiyah." *Al-Hikmah* 8, no. 1 (1986): 63–71. <https://doi.org/https://doi.org/10.24260/al-hikmah.v8i1.72>.
- Kasman. *Hadits Dalam Pandangan Muhammadiyah*. Yogyakarta: Mitra Pustaka, 2012.
- Ma'arif, Ahmad Syafii, Muhammad Quraish Shihab, M. Amin Abdullah, and Yunahar Ilyas. *Tajdid Muhammadiyah Untuk Pencerahan Peradaban*. Yogyakarta: UAD

Press, 2006.

Pimpinan Pusat Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta. "Anggaran Dasar Dan Anggaran Rumah Tangga Muhammadiyah," 2023, 1-23.

Qudamah, Ibnu. "Al-Mughni." Riyadh: Dar Alam al-Kutub, 1997.

Tarjih, Tim PP Muhammadiyah Majelis. *Himpunan Putusan Tarjih Muhammadiyah*. Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2019.

———. *Tanya Jawab Agama 1*. Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2003.

———. *Tanya Jawab Agama 2*. Yogyakarta: Suara Muhammadiyah, 2003.