Sending older parents to the nursing home from the perspective of islamic law

Syamsul Anwar a,1, *
Email: 1 syamsanw@yahoo.com
*Universitas Islam Negeri Sunan Kalijaga, Yogyakarta, Indonesia
*Correspondent

ABSTRACT
In Muslim communities, there are nursing homes and elderly care facilities, some of which are operated by Islamic organizations such as Aisyiyah in Indonesia, which is part of Muhammadiyah. The community grapples with the question of how Islamic law views the act of children placing their elderly parents in nursing homes, given that there are differing opinions on this matter. This article investigates the Islamic perspective on this issue. Using a library research approach, it explores whether it is considered disobedient and thus prohibited or whether positive aspects should be considered. The article concludes on several points, namely: (1) Islamic law strongly emphasizes the obligation of honoring the elderly both by the children or their families, as well as by society and the state; (2) It is obligatory for children to do good (iḥsān) to their parents, which is reflected among others in the form of providing them with proper support and maintenance when they are no longer able to be independent. Deliberately neglecting one's parents and avoiding responsibility for their upkeep out of laziness, despite having the economic and social capacity to do so, is a violation of the child's obligation and is a form of disobedience; and (3) Placing one's parents in a nursing home by the child due to social and economic conditions that make it impossible for them to take care of them on their own and with the consideration that the interests of the parents will be better secured and to avoid neglect and on condition that the parents are willing, is permissible. Placing parents in a nursing home is a last resort after other efforts have been exhausted.

This is an open access article under the CC-BY-SA license.

Introduction
There are questions arising among some people in society regarding how Islamic law perceives children placing their elderly parents in a nursing home. The inquiry emerged due to divergent views on this subject. One perspective argues that it is unjustifiable for a child to place his parents in a nursing home, as this indicates a child’s failure in fulfilling his parental responsibilities by caring for them in their old age. On the other hand, there is a counterargument that sending older
parents into nursing homes does not violate Sharia law (Rahmawati & Syadzali, 2015). In Muslim communities, nursing homes or older care facilities are operating within Muslim communities. For example, in Indonesia, some of them are even run by Islamic groups like Aisyiyah (one of the autonomous organizations within Muhammadiyah) (Azzahra et al., 2021; Daengku & Samosir, 2022; Halima & Syam, 2022; Marsidik & Sihono, 2022; Permana, 2021; Sofia & Sahputri, 2021; Solikhah et al., 2023; Winatakina & Suyadi, 2022; Yuniarlin, 2022). This article examines the Islamic law perspective regarding children sending their parents to nursing homes. Is this considered an act of disobedience and therefore prohibited, or, by contrast, there are several positive aspects to be considered.

Discussion

Definition of Older People

In Islamic turath literature, older people are referred to by several terms such as shaykh (plural shuyūkh), kabīr (plural kibār), musinn, and muʻammar. The phrase syākha ar-rajulu means asanna (the man gets old), kabira (becomes old), or taqaddama fi al-sinn (reaches older age) (A. M. A. H. Umar, 2008). Some lexicographers associate the definition of older people with age and physical characteristics, such as gray hair. Ibn Manẓūr (d. 711/1311) and al-Zabīdī (d. 1205/1791) emphasized that the shaykh was a gray-haired older man (Manẓūr, 1995). According to lexicographers, when associated with his age, the shaikh (older person) is a person whose age reaches 50 or 51 years or older or up to 80 years (Fairuzābādī, Majduddīn Muḥammad ibn Yaʻqūb al-, 1980). There are indications in the Quran associating old age with physical and psychological changes in humans after reaching the peak of prime physical condition. Allah says in His Holy Book, "Allah is He Who shaped you out of weakness, then appointed after wea
kness strength, then, after strength, appointed weakness and grey hair. He createth what He will. He is the Knower, the Mighty" [Q 30: 54]. Al-Zamakhsyarī (d. 538/1144) in Tafsīr al-Kashshāf and Abū Ḥayyān (d. 745/1344) in Tafsīr al-Baḥr al-Muḥīt interpreted "then, after strength, appointed weakness" as old age (al-shaikhūkhah and al-haram) (Al-Zamakhsyarī, 1998; Abū Ḥayyān, 2006). Ibn Kaṣīr (d. 774/1373) interpreted this verse as referring to physical and psychological signs of old age, including a decrease in physical strength and power followed by a decrease in willpower, mobility, and dexterity, as well as changes in physical and psychological conditions (Kathir, 1998).

A hadith narrated by Imam al-Bukhārī (d. 256/870) implies that the age of old age is 60 years, as below (A. ‘Abdillāh M. ibn I. al- Bukhārī, 1987).

عت ن أب ك م تز ر ع ن الن د ي ص ل ي الله عل يه و س ل يم قال أ غ د ر الله إ لى إ م ر و أ خر أ ج ل ة ح تي ي ب ع ه س ي ت ي س ن طنع [رواه البخاري].

Abu Hurairah (May Allah be pleased with him) reported from the Prophet (PBUH) that he...
said, “Allah excuses and grants forgiveness to a person until he attains the age of sixty years.” (A. ‘Abdillāh M. ibn I. al-Bukhārī, 1987).

Badruddīn al-'Ainī (d. 855/1451), one of al-Bukhārī’s commentators, commented on this hadith by saying, “Age is divided into four stages: childhood, youth, adulthood, and old age (al-syaikhukhah). When a person reaches the final stage of the life cycle (old age) at age 60, he or she appears to be weakening, diminishing, and losing strength” (Aīnī, 2001). Thus, 60 years of age in this hadith constitutes old age. There is no agreement regarding age limits for defining old age. The medical definition of old age is based on chronological age, which is 65 years (Sabharwal et al., 2015). In the meantime, participants at the 2000 Harare MDS Workshop agreed that 60 years of age constitutes old age (Kowal et al., 2001). The Law of the Republic of Indonesia Number 13 of 1998 concerning the Welfare of the Elderly emphasizes that old age is a person who reaches the age of 60 years or older (Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 13 Tahun 1998 Tentang Kesejahteraan Lanjut Usia, 2006). This figure of 60 years is also consistent with the United Nations’ definition of an older person as someone 60 or older (Hunter & Böcker, 2023). The definition of older people based on the chronological age, which is 60 years or older from various perspectives, is deemed to be insufficiently accurate because the problems of older people are determined by social, psychological, and health conditions in which the individual is dependent on other people to varying degrees. Numerous individuals aged 60 or older are still productive and capable of being independent. On the other hand, some individuals under 60 cannot advocate for themselves due to illness or disability and require assistance from others. This paper focuses on parents with conditions that prevent them from living independently for the remainder of their lives and who, as a result, are dependent on others to varying degrees.

Problems of Older People

Since the increasing number of senior citizens worldwide and in various nations, there is a need for increased focus on older people. The aging process affects individuals, societies, countries, and the entire world. Hence, the world is experiencing an increase in people aged 60 and older. There were 205 million people aged 60 or older in the world in 1950. In 2012, the global population aged 60 and older increased to 810 million. By 2050, the world’s elderly population will reach approximately two billion. As an illustration, one older person exists for every five people in the world (60 years and older). Since 2000, the number of people aged 60 and older has exceeded the number of children under five for the first (Oró-Piqueras & Falcus, 2018). Population aging is one of the significant demographic megatrends of the 21st century that will transform the global economy and society, influencing numerous facets of individuals' lives (Oró-Piqueras & Falcus, 2018).

Indonesia is also experiencing a population aging process. In 2010, according to the results of...
the 2010 Population Census, the elderly population of Indonesia numbered 18.04 million, or 7.59% of the country’s total population. The proportion of elderly females is more significant (9.75%) than that of elderly males (8.29%) (Statistik, 2010). Eleven years later, in 2021, the percentage of elderly Indonesian reached 10.82%, or approximately 29.3 million people, with a more significant proportion of older women (52.32%) than older men (47.68%) (Statistik, 2010). The growing proportion of older people has economic and social consequences. As stated by Ade Rustama, as cited by Kurniawan A. Wicaksono, the problem for older people in Indonesia consists of several factors: first, health problems in the form of diminished physical and mental abilities, followed by the possibility of disease. This results in impairment, necessitating health care services and dependence on others. Deafness, blindness, and disability are impairments experienced by older people. Second, other problem includes economic difficulties, as a result of decreased work productivity and due to reaching retirement age and leaving a job that has been a source of income. Meanwhile, job opportunities for older people are limited. In addition, many older people do not have pensions or social security. Due to low income, poor health and nutrition, and restricted access to essential services, poverty has become the greatest threat to the welfare of older people. Thirdly, social problems are caused by changes in people’s lifestyles, family structures, social values, neglect, violence, and social exclusion. When children or families are poor, older people are frequently neglected (Santika, 2018). Conflicts within the family contribute to the deterioration of living conditions for older people, despite their affluence.

Islamic Teachings for Old Age and Caring for Parents

Undoubtedly, Islam cares deeply for, protects, and reveres old age people. Moslem scholars have examined this topic in great detail in their numerous works (Bensaid & Grine, 2014; S. M. al Hilālī, 2002; Qaraḍāwī, 2003; Zabīdī, 2012). One of the fundamental values of Islamic teaching is to honor and protect old age people, which is the fundamental essential value of human dignity (karāmah insāniyyah), that emphasizes that humans, as humans, are creatures that have noble dignity and, therefore, must be respected, protected, and prospered, including the older people. In one of his hadiths, the Prophet PBUH said,

اِنَّ مِنْ إِجْلاَلِ اللَّهِ إِكْرَامَ ذِي الشَّيْبَةِ الُْْسْلِمِ

(Indeed, including the exaltation of Allah is the glorification of the elderly people) [narrated by al-Bukhārī in al-Adab al-Mufrad and by Abū Dawūd] (M. ibn I. al Bukhārī, 1998; Dāwūd, 2015). The decision of Tarjih Muhammadiyah emphasized several points related to the older people as follows,
• **Point 4:** Islam promotes a community of nurses, philanthropes, and mercy-bearers that requires maximum healing efforts, comprehensive care, and humane assistance as part of the embodiment of ethical responsibilities inherent to human identity as social beings and as a sign of true Islamic society.

• **Point 6:** It is necessary to maximize services for older people, particularly those who are vulnerable due to the age factor, which eliminates some physical and mental abilities so that they can live noble and dignified lives, following the hadith, "Not one of us he who shows no mercy to your younger and does not acknowledge the honor due to our elder." [narrated by al-Tirmižī and al-Bukhari in *al-Adab al-Mufrad*].

If Islam teaches the responsibility to respect and protect older people in general, it emphasizes in the first place the duty of children to respect and care for their parents (mothers and fathers). Several verses of the Quran and the hadith of the Prophet emphasize this matter. Four verses in the command us to honor our parents, such as Q 2: 83; 4: 36; 6: 152; and 17: 23. In Q 17: 23, for example, Allah says;

وَقَضَى رَبُّكَ أَلََّّ تَعْبُدُوا إِلََّ إِيَّاهُ وَبِالْوَالِدَيْنِ إِحْسَانًا إِمَّا يَبْلُغَنَّ عِنْدَكَ الْكِبَرَ أَحَدُهُ مَا أَوْ كِلاَهُمَا فَلاَ تَقُلْ لَهُمَا أُفٍّ وَلََّ تَنْهَرْهُمَا وَقُلْ لَهُمَا قَوْلًَّ كَرِيمًا [Q 17: 23].

Thy Lord hath decreed, that ye worship none save Him, and (that ye show) kindness to parents. If one of them or both of them attain old age with thee, say not "Fie" unto them nor repulse them, but speak unto them a gracious word. [Q 17: 23].

Al-Qurtubi (d. 671/1273) explains that the emphasis on old age in this verse is because old age is a condition in which parents (mother and father) experience a decline in their abilities, necessitating good treatment from their children. Since both are entirely dependent on the child, the child must provide more care for both (Qurtubi, 2006). Even in Q 31: 15, it is emphasized that children must fulfill their obligation to do good, even if their parents are polytheists. However, they are reminded that children should not comply with parents who encourage them to evade responsibility. In the hadith of the Prophet, doing good to both parents (*birr al-walidain*) is one of the most beloved deeds, alongside praying on time and waging jihad in Allah’s cause (A. ‘Abdillah M. ibn I. al- Bukhari, 1987). In contrast, disobedience to both parents is considered a major sin and is equivalent to *shirk* from the Islamic perspective (A. ‘Abdillah M. ibn I. al- Bukhari, 1987). Abandoning parents is a form of disobedience to them.

**Islamic View on Sending Parents to Nursing Home**

As previously indicated, Islamic teachings pay attention to older people and parents significantly. Multiple generations of Muslim scholars have discussed the issue of older people from ethical, legal, social, and other perspectives, as the Islamic teachings emphasize the
obligation to respect senior men/women. Among the Islamic scholars who first wrote about older people was Abū Ḥātim al-Sijistānī (d. 250/864) in his book Kitāb al-Mu'ammarin min al-'Arab (Sijistānī, 1905). Later, more discussion about older people from various perspectives is well written in Arabic, English, and other languages. However, very few discuss the Islamic perspective implications of children placing their parents in nursing homes. Al-Hilālī, Al-Hill, who wrote over 950 pages about older people from the perspective of Islamic law, did not mention the status of the children who place their parents in nursing homes. He discussed in great detail the provisions of Sharia law for older people, beginning with aspects of worship and its many subsidiary rulings and moving on to criminal matters and jihad (S. M. al- Hilālī, 2002).

Benaouda Bensaid and Fadila Grine of IIUM wrote a comprehensive article on older people from an Islamic perspective in English. However, they did not address the issue of children who send their parents to nursing homes (Bensaid & Grine, 2014). According to Yūsuf al-Qaraḍāwī, who writes about the rights of older people, stated that some individuals may be more fortunate than the older woman, who passes away alone in her home, unnoticed by anyone. They reside in a nursing home where they spend their later years with fellow older people. However, the provisions and amenities offered by nursing homes cannot replace the affection and warmth of their family (Qaraḍāwī, 2003). There appears to be a hesitancy among scholars to discuss the legal aspect of children placing their parents in nursing homes because they perceive parental care in nursing homes to be contrary to Islamic teachings and children’s obligation to care for their parents. Some issued fatwas view the act of sending the parents to the nursing homes as disobedient action.

Among them is a fatwa issued by Dā‘irat al-Iftā’ Jordan, which essentially states that it is forbidden for children to place their parents in a nursing home, as doing so amounts to ostracizing them and becoming a cause of su‘ul khatimah (lousy end) at the end of their lives, and Allah will hasten the punishment of children’s lawlessness in the world prior to his death (Qaraḍāwī, 2003). Following this fatwa, another fatwa was issued by Shaykh 'Abd al-Ḥamīd al-Ątrash, former chair of the Al-Azhar Fatwa Committee, who is referencing numerous Quranic verses and hadith, that entrusting parents to nursing homes is considered a transgression. He elaborated that the obligation of caregiving—encompassing sustenance, nourishment, and financial support—rests with the children and cannot be evaded. Hence, disobedient children should understand that Allah’s punishment for all sins is postponed until the hereafter, except for the sins of disobedience to both parents, which are accelerated in this world. This fatwa is notably stringent and disregards the additional dimension of parental care in nursing homes. Some believe that leaving their parents in a nursing home is the most heinous form of disobedience, raising debate about whether such an individual can even be considered human (Munajjad, 2018).
On the other hand, there is a fatwa that is more moderate, which states that it is not permissible to leave parents in a nursing home without the consent, permission, and willingness of the parents themselves, as long as the consent is not given out of necessity due to the child’s mistreatment (A. M. Umar, 2008). Although it is still forbidden, this fatwa is more lenient in that safekeeping may be performed if circumstances require it, and it is not coerced. In this instance, Ahmad Mamdūḥ, Fatwa Secretary at Dār al-İftā’ Egypt, emphasized that we should not rush to label children who leave their parents in nursing homes with disobedient or other despicable characteristics. In principle, children are responsible for caring for their older parents. However, it must be remembered that problem conditions vary from person to person. Entrusting the parents in nursing homes may be intended to honor their parents and provide them better care. We should not judge a person’s actions without considering their circumstances (Al-İftā’, 2021). This explanation indicates that parental care by children in nursing homes need not be punished as an act of disobedience immediately. We must examine the circumstances to determine whether such an action is feasible. Let us examine the fatwas declaring the act of placing older parents in a nursing home to be disobedient.

The real issue is how to interpret and apply the commands to honor and care for parents in the Holy Quran and the Sunnah of the Prophet in concrete social circumstances. No passage explicitly states that entrusting the parents in nursing homes constitutes disobedience. If the issue is more related to the manner of interpretation and application in different circumstances, then there is room for alternative interpretations in the light of the actual circumstances. Here, I attempt to apply Islamic legal norm istinbat (the legal decision-making process) in a more flexible manner, taking into account the current state of our society and without diminishing the meaning of the verses and hadiths related to this topic. Consequently, this article attempts to approach this issue by considering (1) the hierarchy of Sharia norms and (2) the present state of our society. Sharia norms can be arranged in a three-tiered structure: (1) fundamental or grand norm (al-qiyam al-asāsiyyah), (2) general principles (al-uṣūl al-kuliyyah), and (3) detailed rulings (al-aḥkām al-farʻiyyah) (Anwar, 2016, 2018, 2020). First, human dignity is fundamental to values related to problems (karāmah insāniyyah). This concept can be derived from several Quranic verses, including the words of Allah, "Verily we have honored the Children of Adam" [Q 17: 70]. From this fundamental value/norm, principles can be derived, including the principle that every person has rights. The purpose of these rights is to realize human dignity, including the right of older people to be respected and protected as they age, mainly when they are no longer capable of complete independence. Several detailed rulings (al-aḥkām al-farʻiyyah) were derived from this principle, including the obligation of children to protect and care for their parents. Second, is the fundamental value of solidarity, which is emphasized in several Prophetic hadiths, among others.
From this fundamental value of solidarity is derived the principle that everyone has the right to receive assistance from others, as well as the obligation between individuals to provide this assistance. Some detailed rulings (al-aḥkām al-farʿiyyah) were derived from this principle, including the Prophet’s hadith-obligate to help hungry neighbors.

Even though this hadith only mentions hungry people, a broader context of Islamic teaching indicates a society’s obligation to assist and liberate all the poor from their helplessness, including older people. Following the hadith of Abū Hurairah, not only does society as a whole, but also the state has a similar obligation.

According to al-Qaraḍāwī, the weak in this hadith are helpless due to poverty, starvation, and their inability to provide for themselves because they are still children or elderly (Qaraḍāwī, 2003). This hadith describes, among other things, the state’s responsibility towards the elderly, as the welfare of the elderly is not only the responsibility of their children and families but also that of the state. In the Indonesian context, this is made abundantly clear in the Preamble to the 1945 Constitution, which emphasizes that the state’s goals include protecting the entire Indonesian nation and promoting the general welfare. Third, the fundamental value of the benefit (al-maṣlaḥah). From this fundamental value, several principles are derived in implementing Sharia
provisions. Among them are:

a. The principle of ease (*al-taṣīr*), it is mentioned in several verses of the Quran and the hadith of the Prophet Muhammad and from which several principles of jurisprudence were formulated, including (Difficulty paves the way for ease).

b. The principle of not causing harm, following the hadith of the Prophet,

\[
\text{عَنِ ابْنِ عَبَّاسِ قَالَ قَالَ رَسُولُ اللهِ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ لََّ ضَرَرَ وَلََّ ضِرَارَ .}
\]

From Ibn 'Abbās (it is narrated that), he said, “The Messenger of Allah PBUH said: There should be neither harming nor reciprocating harm” [narrated by Malik and Ahmad, and the wording is attributed to the latter].

In *fiqh* rules, it is emphasized, (the harm [must] be eliminated).

a. The principle of implementing *taklīf* (religious obligation) according to ability

\[
لَا يُكَلِ فُ اللََُّّ نَفْسًا إِلََّ وُسْعَهَا [البقرة: 286]
\]

Allah tasketh not a soul except beyong its scoop [Q 2: 286]

\[
فَاتَّقُوا اللَََّ مَا اسْتَطَعْتُمْ: [النَّغَابِن: 16]
\]

So keep your duty to Allah as best ye can [Q 64: 16]

\[
عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ عَنِ النَّبِيِّ صَلَّى اللهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ قَالَ ... وَإِذَا أمَرْتُكُمْ بأمْرٍ فَأْتُوا مِنْهُ مَا اسْتَطَعْتُمْ [متفق عليه]
\]

From Abū Hurairah, from the Prophet PBUH (it was narrated that), he said: “... and do what I command you to the best of your ability and capacity” [Hadith muttafaq 'alaih].

It is as an application of this ability principle that the oft-quoted maxim, i.e. (what cannot be fully achieved, should not be wholly abandoned), is derived. Sociological evidence demonstrates that the condition of Muslim families is highly diverse. Some individuals have access to a spacious living area and a household assistant who can assist with family needs. However, some are also materially affluent but socially and familiarly unbalanced due to the prevalence of family conflicts that make the environment unsuitable for older people’s parents to reside in. On the other hand, it cannot be denied that most Muslim families, especially in the lower middle class, live only with nuclear families. The husband and wife must work to meet the family’s essential needs. Sometimes, whether they own or rent their home, it is frequently too small to accommodate their parents (grandmothers/grandfathers) and household assistant. As al Fārūqī (d. 1406/1986)
argued, Islam prioritizes extended family forms in which at least one family lives in one house consisting of members from three generations: grandmothers/grandfathers, mothers/fathers, and children/grandchildren; additional family members may also be present. This concept is intended to prevent generational gaps while simultaneously ensuring the transmission of values and traditions and the development of a disciplined attitude that respects family and social norms (Al-Faruqi, 1992). However, this ideal form cannot always be realized due to the pressures of circumstances, so many Muslim families live only in small family groups (nuclear families).

Consequently, they cannot accommodate their parents at home. It is not inconceivable that, if enforced, it could result in the parents not receiving adequate care and abandoning their children at home because they must work outside to meet their economic needs. On the other hand, Islamic teachings aim to achieved good interest (al-maṣlaḥah), avoid harm (al-ḍarar), provide convenience, and to eliminate hardship and difficulty. Therefore, a fatwa that considers the welfare of both the children and the parents and the prevailing conditions is more likely to be accepted. When a child's social circumstances prevent them from providing optimal care for their parents, placing their parents in a nursing home is neither wholly harmful nor necessarily contrary to Islamic law. Yes, this action may has a little bit negative consequences, such as losing family warmth due to separation from children, grandchildren, and other relatives. But, however, in nursing homes parents receive proper care, can interact with others, and participate in regular activities for older people as part of standardized nursing home services.

**Conclusion**

From the aforementioned, the following conclusions can be drawn as follows: (1) According to Islamic law, children, their families, society, and the state must show respect and honor to older people; (2) Children are obligated to do good (iḥsān) to their parents, which includes providing proper union and care for them when they cannot care for themselves. Intentionally avoiding the responsibility of caring for one's parents out of laziness, despite having the financial and social means to do so, violates the child's responsibilities and constitutes disobedience; (3) To place parents with their consent in a nursing home by their children, due the latter's social and economic circumstances which do not enable them to directly by themselves take care of them and with the objective to ensure a better attention and service for them and this decision is taken as an absolute last resort when all other options have been exhausted, is not in contradistinction to the Islamic law. Differently put, as long as the above conditions are met, this action can be categorized as permissible.
References


