

Study on Lecturer Characteristics to Support the Effectiveness of Entrepreneurship Education at University

¹Badrud Tamam, ²Riema Afriani Kusumadewi, ³Putri Anggraeni

^{1,2,3}STAI Darussalam Kunir, Subang, Indonesia

¹badrud83@gmail.com; ²riemaafriani Kusumadewi@staidarussalam.ac.id;

³putrianggraeni@staidarussalam.ac.id

Article Info

Article history

Received March 17, 2023

Revised May 16, 2023

Accepted May 17, 2023

Keywords: entrepreneurship education; entrepreneurship education in universities; entrepreneurship lecture

ABSTRACT

The research was motivated by the understanding that entrepreneurship education can improve a nation's competitiveness, overcome the unemployment explosion, create job opportunities, and promote the nation's economy. The focus of the research problem is how the characteristics of the lecture support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at Ciputra University (UC) in producing world-class entrepreneurs. This study aims to gain an overview of lecturer characteristics to help the point of entrepreneurship education at UC.

The approach used in this study is the qualitative approach. The qualitative research method used is a case study; the data collection process is done through unstructured observation, in-depth interviews, and documentation study. The determination of the sample of respondents is purposive and snowball. The respondents are the leaders of foundations, institutions/Ltd., faculty, courses, students, and alums. Research steps include: developing categories and instruments, collecting field data, processing data, describing, discussing, concluding, verifying the validity, and preparing research reports.

From the research, the researcher concluded: that there are common characteristics for the lecturers who support entrepreneurship education; The recommendations proposed are by adopting a hypothetical model of practical lecture for entrepreneurship education offered in this dissertation which is expected to be an alternative to the development of entrepreneurship education in universities.

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background

Entering the globalization era, competition in various economic, social, technological, industry, and education sectors is increasing. Each country is trying to improve its ability to compete with other countries. This resulted in competition among individuals or citizens of a nation. The turmoil of competition in every individual inflicts the desire to keep improving themselves through education; they all try to get the highest education possible.

The number of people who want to have higher education is in line with the fact that every year the number of students who graduated from high school (SMA) that apply to universities continues to rise. Statistical data of universities reported by the Ministry of Education

and Culture show an increase in the number of high school graduates who continue higher education. The number of applicants accepted as freshmen at state universities increased significantly. The increase in this ratio mainly occurred after the school year 2008/2009, the period after establishing an independent lane as an alternative entrance to State Universities outside the regular lane. With a separate route, the number of seats in each department also increased automatically. The increase in the ratio of the number of new students accepted in the state universities may be interpreted as the level of competition for entering the state universities being more relaxed than in the previous periods. As an illustration, the 2006/2007 academic year recorded an average of only 22 percent of the applicants accepted as freshmen at state universities. However, in the academic year of 2009/2010, the number of applicants admitted as first-year students increased by an average of 40 percent (Kompas.com, 2011).

The increase in the number of applicants to state and private universities affect the increasing number of educated unemployed who have a final or equivalent education to those with college degrees.

Assistant Deputy Youth Pioneering Sector of the Ministry of Youth and Sports, Muh Abud Musa'ad, said that the unemployment rate of educated youth reached 47.81 percent of the total national unemployment figures (Republika Online, 2012). At the same time, the highest number of educated unemployed are university graduates, which is 12.78 percent. The next position is followed by high school graduates (11.9 percent), vocational school graduates (11.87 percent), junior high school graduates (7.45 percent), and elementary school graduates (3.81 percent). Furthermore, the Indonesian youth unemployment rate is also one of the highest compared to other countries. The number of unemployed youth in Indonesia reached 25.1 percent of the total labor force (Republika Online, 2012). This is a highly alarming figure, as the number of graduates is not offset by the number of jobs available, impacting many educated unemployed.

In any case, job opportunities became an issue closely related to the increasing unemployment in Indonesia. According to the Advisory of East Java Board of Education Daniel Rosyid, Indonesia's increasing number of unemployed intellectuals is due to the need for more student competence. Second is Indonesia's lack of job opportunities (Republika Online, 2012).

Furthermore, the phenomenon of intellectual unemployment is also expressed by the Minister of Manpower and Transmigration, Muhaimin Iskandar. He said that 610 thousand of the total 7.17 million unemployed in Indonesia are "intellectual unemployment" or from among university graduates. In the Central Statistics Agency data collection, there is 610 thousand 'intellectual unemployment' in Indonesia, which can be considered an HR (human resources) emergency, in more details Muhaimin revealed that 190 thousand out of 610 thousand unemployed intellectuals were graduates of diploma I / II / III, while unemployed university graduates strata I reached 420 thousand people (Tribune News.com, 2013).

Intellectual or educated unemployment is becoming very apparent and actual when large companies conduct open recruitment or job openings. As is the case with several hundred seats being contested by tens of thousands of applicants, as happened on one of the television companies in Indonesia, 110 thousand applicants in Indonesia competed for 500 positions at Trans TV and Trans 7, which resulted in an atmosphere of exams at the Bung Karno, Senayan, Jakarta, felt like UMPTN test whose name was changed into SPMB today (CNN News, 2007).

The burst of applicants was due to the university graduates needing the creativity, desire, and skill to create job opportunities. In addition, the culture and mindset of Indonesian who feel more proud to be an employee become an obstacle in creating job opportunities. The burst of applicants was a tendency of the growing number of highly educated unemployed, which has become increasingly alarming. Such a phenomenon is related to the mindset of scholars who generally intend to become civil servants or private employees. In contrast, employment in both private and government is minimal compared to the labor force. Education in Indonesia produces new job seekers instead of job creators.

This burst of applicants phenomenon occurs in private companies, the governance sector, and civil servants. This burst was muddied further by the number of civil servants who retired this year (2013) reached approximately 110 thousand, and those who will be accepted are only about 60 thousand employees (Antara News, 2013).

To overcome the above conditions, every individual or citizen can change their mindset that after graduating from school or university, they do not always have to look for job opportunities. Still, they can create job opportunities by creating products or services which later will reduce the number of unemployed and increase the competitiveness of nations. As stated by Suryadi, every citizen in all countries increasingly has the opportunity to produce a good product or service and market it to other parts of the world. Nevertheless, only countries with the most creative people will be prosperous in winning the competition (Suryadi, 2012, p. 28).

Creative people are human beings who have the knowledge, skills and can provide solutions to various problems of life. Creative people can be generated through the process of education, as the content of Article 1 of Chapter I of Law No. 20 of the National Education System:

"Education is a conscious and deliberate effort to create an atmosphere of learning and the learning process so that learners actively develop their potentials to have the spiritual power of religion, self-control, personality, intelligence, character, and skills needed by him, society, nation, and country," based on the above laws, the author can understand that through education the number of unemployed intellectuals or educated unemployment can be minimized. Education should consider what learners will face in the future to reduce the number of educated unemployed. An effective education is an education that does not only

prepare students for a profession or occupation but also can produce someone capable of solving problems encountered in everyday life. Education in this matter is also expected to be a means to improve the competitiveness of a nation. According to the Research and Technology Minister of Indonesia, Gusti Muhammad Hatta, some causes of the declining competitiveness of Indonesia, among others, are poor infrastructure, technological readiness, and innovation (Antara News, 2012). Technology readiness and innovation depend on the individual or human resources (HR) ability who have the creativity and those who wish to make changes by innovating.

The human resources who have innovation (innovators) are human beings who can create or develop something new and unique (entrepreneurs); as has been stated by Hisrich (2005, p. 7), namely: *Entrepreneur, as an innovator, is an individual developing something unique and entrepreneurship is the process of creating something new and assuming risks and rewards.*

An entrepreneurship or entrepreneurship education program that can give birth to new seedlings of Indonesian entrepreneurs is required to create innovators or entrepreneurs. Entrepreneurship education is an education that integrates entrepreneurship learning systematically and thoroughly to ensure the birth of young generations who are financially independent (Ciputra, 2011, p. 98). The research shows that entrepreneurship students studying for a graduate degree have entrepreneurial skills and try to improve themselves towards entrepreneurship (Gozum, 2012).

In reviewing the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education in universities, we have to know about lecture characteristics that can support the point of entrepreneurship education (Lecture is the same meaning as "teacher") because Teachers are also claimed to play a role in controlling the effectiveness of the implementation of quality improvement policies, innovation, and democratization of education (Villega-Reimer: 2004). And also, many findings suggest a strong link between what teachers do and students' success rates in learning (Sean: 2004, Borman and Kimbell: 2005). What teachers do is related to human capital. It affects entrepreneurship for university entrepreneurship lecturers in Indonesia, meaning that competent human capital provides quality and increased entrepreneurship for university lecturers in Indonesia. Human capital owned by entrepreneurship lecturers in Indonesia can create, transfer, and implement knowledge to their students, thereby improving lecturer performance (Dwita, 2022). Based on the explanation above, the author must choose one question what are the characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at Ciputra University?

The University of Ciputra is one of the universities in Indonesia that is considered worthy of becoming the object of study. Forming an entrepreneurial spirit from the beginning is the mission and fundamental uniqueness of University of Ciputra (UC). While other universities still focus on creating trained workers, UC has established job creators. For four years, the

curriculum teaching of each study flow has been packed with an entrepreneurial spirit, making it a unique teaching and learning system that can simultaneously improve students' skills and soft skills. This is reflected in the "Reboan" program, which is entrepreneurship education included in the curriculum from semester one to the sixth semester. The reborn curriculum owned by UC can produce an entrepreneur; this follows what Fatima said in her research (2015) that "curricula content and teaching methods vary depending on the program's objectives—from theoretical courses aiming to increase entrepreneurial awareness to practical-oriented ones that aim to produce graduates ready to start a business." Another uniqueness of Uc is the name of Ciputra University, referred to Indonesian entrepreneur Dr. Ir. Ciputra, the Chairman or the President of the Ciputra Group founded this university.

1.2. Research Question

Based on the research background and the identification of problems, the focus of the research problem can be formulated as follows: "What are The characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at the University of Ciputra."

1.3. Research Objective

This research generally aims to evaluate the characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at the University of Ciputra.

2. METHODS

The method for this study is using qualitative research methodology with a case study approach. Researchers attempt to collect data and facts related to characteristics lectures to support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education in universities by establishing research instruments in the form of instruments format supported by interviews, observation as well as documentation study. The research data sources are events, objects, and actions related to problems in implementing entrepreneurship education in Higher Education. To photograph events, things, and activities of these actions, a representative respondent, someone involved directly or indirectly or in qualitative research, is known as a research sample. The sample itself is determined by the snowball sampling technique, meaning that relatively few respondents and purposive are selected according to the purpose of the study. Still, the number of respondents will continue to grow according to the purpose of the study. Based on this, the respondents or informants of this research are the Founder of the University (Ciputra Foundation), University Leaders (Rector), faculty leaders (dean and assistant dean), teaching lecturers, students, alumni, and all parties related to the implementation of the teaching and learning process of entrepreneurship education at Ciputra University with a total number of respondents as many as ten people.

To facilitate researchers in conducting research and making instruments, the summary of the matrix table and data collection tools as research guidelines were created first. The

analysis technique that has been used in this analysis uses steps as proposed by Miles and Huberman in Sugiyono (2010 Hlm.337) as follows:

2.1. Data Collection

At this stage, researchers obtain primary data from the informants through in-depth interviews, which will be recorded using a recorder or mobile phone camera. Recorded data is then written and converted into written form. In addition, secondary data was obtained through documentation study from the strategic plan of the University, Ciputra handbooks, Entrepreneurship journals, and the University entrepreneurship curriculum guidebooks. Data were also obtained from the observation results done by the writer while visiting the University of Ciputra Surabaya. Here is the process of data collection conducted by researchers:

- a. Make field notes from interviews, observation, and documentation.
- b. Summarize field notes from interviews, observation, and documentation.
- c. Perform member checks of the summary reports of interview results, observation, and documentation study with concerned research subjects.
- d. Triangulate to obtain the validity of the data. Triangulation is done to confirm the results of interviews, observation, and documentation study. This is done to determine whether or not the data obtained are mutually supportive.
- e. Fix summary report that the data obtained by the intended subject of the study and following the source.

2.2. Data reduction

At this stage, the researcher chose the data relevant to the subject. Data is provided for a brief explanation, then classified or categorized based on the problem formulation. Reports from the field are reduced, summarized, selected the fundamental things, focused on essential items, and systematically arranged to be easily controlled. The data reduced gives a clearer image of the observation results while making it easier for researchers to search again for the data obtained when required. Tables 1 and 2 are an example of a data reduction process in this study.

Table 1. Examples of Interview Results Data of Field Notes

<p>Interview with the Rector of UC Day/Date: Wednesday/March 6, 2013 Time: 12 pm Duration: 47 minutes 36 seconds Venue: Rector of UC office</p>
<p>Question : What are the characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at the University of Ciputra?</p>
<p>The answer to the question : To answer this question related to the Philosophy of entrepreneurship education at UC refers to Mr. Ci that entrepreneurship education can be taught. To be prepared, the condition must be the right way, the suitable teaching materials, and the right instructor. The right way means the new method should be directly done in an actual application; in addition to the theory, we project-biassed, which means doing the project significantly but escorted. The right instructors suggest that teachers' competence must be suitable for teaching theory and practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics. The proper subject to be taught means that students who attend UC begin with the selection under the conditions of ECM, called Entrepreneurship capacity mapping. ECM has eight psychological tests to examine the IQ, personality, and intentions of business interests. Those who pass the tests will then be accepted..... Whereas vision and mission of the convening of entrepreneurship education at UC refer to strategic planning that is divided into three main objectives, namely Objective 1, objective 2, and Objective 3:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Objective 1, <i>entrepreneurship-focused university</i> or university focusing on learning Entrepreneurship. 2. Objective 2, <i>entrepreneurial university</i> in which if we want to teach entrepreneurship, its operation should be as entrepreneurial as possible. 3. Objective 3, <i>world-class entrepreneurship</i>, means to universities that want to produce world-class entrepreneur standards, the education that focuses on its implementation and infrastructure must also be world-class standard.

Table 2. Examples of Data Reduction Format Interview Questions

Question	Description	Meaning
Characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC	Related to Philosophy of entrepreneurship education at UC refers to Mr. Ci that entrepreneurship education can be taught. The conditions are the right way, suitable teaching materials, and the right instructor. The right instructors mean teachers' competence must be ideal for teaching theory and practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics.	The characteristics of lecturers that can support entrepreneurship education at UC are that the lecturers' competence must be suitable for teaching theory and teaching practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics.

After being identified, the substance of sources is then put into the coding as Table 3:

Table 3. Coding Examples of Data Reduction Results

Description	Meaning	Coding
Characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC are that the lecture's competence must be suitable for teaching theory and teaching practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics.	Characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC related to the Philosophy of entrepreneurship education at UC must be suitable for teaching theory and teaching practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics.	UC.WR.01.

2.3. Data Presentation (Data Display)

At this stage, the author explains the analysis results that will be described through brief descriptions in the form of narrative text. The writer must then be able to interpret overall what will be written as the material analysis. Here is an example of data presentation (data display), which is made in the form of a matrix table presented in Table 4:

Table 4. Examples of Data Presentation (Data Display Comparative Analysis of Patterns from the Findings)

Focus Problem
Research findings about characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC are: characteristics of lecturers that can help the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC must be suitable for teaching theory and teaching practice, and there should be a collaboration between practitioners and academics.

The process of data presentation (data display) is an attempt to find a pattern initial on the characteristics of lectures that support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education in universities (a case study at the University of Ciputra Surabaya). The above form of presentation is then developed based on the focus of the problem in Table 5:

Table 5. Patterns of Focus Problem

How to determine the characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC?
Patterns Found
1.1 Right instructor
1.2 Competence in Theory and Practice
1.3 <i>Collaboration Academics and practitioner</i>
The research findings on determining the characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC Entrepreneurship education curriculum policy is that entrepreneurship education is included in the compulsory subjects in UC, which means all the majors are obliged to implement entrepreneurship lectures.
1. At UC, entrepreneurship has become a compulsory subject since the 1st semester to the fifth, which in one semester consists of 3 credits for a total of 15 credits. During these 15 credits, all lecturers from any department encourage students to engage in entrepreneurship.
2. Courses or entrepreneurship education at UC are called E1 up to E5. In E1, students are given a personal selling project, which is the individual task of establishing cooperation with suppliers, foundations, and NGOs—such cooperation results in the students earning money from product sales.

2.4 Data verification

Data verification is an attempt to find the meaning of previously collected data. At this stage, the researchers had answered the formulated problem formulation. Satori and Komariah (2010, p. 100) state that the conclusions in qualitative research into the quintessence answer to the problem formulation and its contents are the crystallization of field data valuable to the practice and science development. And this conclusion is a new invention in the form of models of effective entrepreneurship education in universities. Here is an example of a data verification or determination:

Data verification is an attempt to find the meaning of previously collected data. At this stage, the researchers had answered the formulated problem formulation. Satori and Komariah (2010, p. 100) state that the conclusions in qualitative research into the quintessence answer to the problem formulation and its contents are the crystallization of field data valuable to the practice and science development. And this conclusion is a new invention in the form of sample models of effective entrepreneurship education in universities. Table 6 is an example of a data verification or conclusion:

Table 6. Examples of Data Verification

<p>Findings on Focus Problem</p> <p>The findings of research on characteristics of lecturers that can support the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education at UC:</p> <p>There are no minimum qualification standards for some lecturers or facilitators who teach entrepreneurship at UC. Still, the lecturers who teach entrepreneurship courses at UC are professionals, experienced, and successful in their fields, so they can pass on the spirit of entrepreneurship.</p>

3. RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

RESULTS

Based on a study of documents in the UC entrepreneurship journal, it is written that lecturers at UC are a combination of full-time lecturers as entrepreneur enablers and real entrepreneurs/professionals commonly called Entrepreneurs in Residence EiR.

In contrast to what is described in the UC entrepreneurship journal, data according to the book document Ciputra Quantum Leap (2012, p.116) explains that the characteristics of lecturers who teach entrepreneurship education consist of:

- Specialist: a trainer/facilitator for specific skills prospective entrepreneurs need. You don't need to be an entrepreneur but have the skills to transfer well.
- Entrepreneurial educators: teachers/academics who understand pedagogies.
- Mentor: a person who practices innovative entrepreneurship in the business world

Based on the above, it shows the characteristics of lecturers, facilitators, and speakers at Ciputra University, consisting of academics and practitioners, where entrepreneurship education at UC is facilitated or taught by mentors who are not pure academics but mentors who have professional backgrounds in organizations, both business, and non-business. On the other hand, the result of the interview with the Rector of UC is that there are no specific standards or characteristics for lecturers who teach at UC; Lecturers or teaching staff at UC are collaborations between academics and practitioners.

This was also conveyed by Mr. Denny, a lecturer and administrator of the Ciputra Foundation, that there are no unique characteristics and standards for lecturers who teach at UC. And the most important thing, according to Mr. Denny, to become a lecturer at UC must be the intention to spend time, be wise and commit. Added also by Mr. Ronald, who is an IBM faculty lecturer, where thinks that there are no unique characteristics for lecturers who teach at UC, but there are characteristics of lecturers in general, added by Mr. Djohan as dean of the Faculty of Entrepreneurship and Humanities that not all lecturers at UC have businesses, but according to Mrs. Lily, an assistant dean said that all lecturers at UC from any department must be able to teach entrepreneurship.

Agree with UC officials, UC students and alumni perceive that the characteristics of lecturers at UC are divided into three groups: academics, entrepreneurs in residence, and intrapreneurs, all of which must be flexible.

Unlike the interview results above, observations in several entrepreneurship classes show that lecturers who teach entrepreneurship, both full-time lecturers (academics) and real entrepreneurs/professionals (practitioners), must have experience in the start-up business world.

However, based on these observations and documentation, it was found that practitioner lecturers still need to be S2 but have been allowed to teach at S1.

Even though these practitioner lecturers have academic qualifications that are not by national standards of education, they are successful professionals in their fields, one of whom is a UC fresh graduate alumni who have been allowed to teach at S1 because they are the CEO and editor-in-chief of studentpreneur magazine, one of the business magazines intended for teenagers in Indonesia with more than 100,000 readers.

An entrepreneurial university can not only be on the condition of running framework for an entrepreneurial university, but also the policies issued by the government (in this case, the Indonesian government) should be considered. Referring to Law No. 12 of 2012, article 35 states that UC has not fully implemented higher education curriculum based on national

higher education standards. It is indicated by the presence of lecturers who still need to follow national higher education standards.

There are no minimum qualification standards for some lecturers or facilitators who teach entrepreneurship at UC. Still, the lecturers who teach entrepreneurship courses at UC are professionals, experienced, and successful in their fields because they have the entrepreneurial competency to pass on the spirit of entrepreneurship. Saranza 2022, proposed six areas of entrepreneurial competency: commitment, conceptual, human relations, opportunity, organizational, and strategic competencies.

DISCUSSION

Effective education is similar to effective learning. According to Sutikno (2005), effective learning enables learners to learn quickly and flexibly and achieve the desired learning objectives. Meanwhile, Eggen & Kauchak (1998), in Krisnawan (2009, p. 1), it is explained that there are six characteristics of effective learning.

- a) Students become active reviewers towards their environment through observing, comparing, finding similarities and differences, and forming concepts and generalizations based on similarities found.
- b) Teacher presents the material as the lesson's focus of thinking and interacting.
- c) The activities of the students are based entirely on the assessment.
- d) Teachers (in this case, the lecturers) actively advise and guide students in analyzing the information.

Findings showed that The factors that influence the development of entrepreneurship education are divided into supply and demand categories. Data show that the increasing number of policies and the expansion of business schools positively correlate with the development of entrepreneurship education. In contrast, the advancement of academia and the lowering of employment pressure are negative indicators (Lin & Xu, 2017).

At the University of Ciputra, they are developing thinking and understanding that effective entrepreneurship education could change emerging mindsets and habits or customs. That education can change people who have yet to have the mindset of entrepreneurs to become a man with the attitude of entrepreneurs and must be able to change the mentality of the people who have not had the direction to be someone who has the mind of a risk taker. The understanding is also reinforced that in addition to changing the mindset of entrepreneurship, education is said to be effective if it teaches theory and practice and transfers entrepreneurial spirit. This is in agreement with Chux's research which states that institutions offering entrepreneurship programs must saddle the responsibility to ensure that the persons used to deliver the courses are highly competent and can kindle the entrepreneurial intention flame in students. And the educator needs to modify the system to reflect the curriculum to suit the changing economic environment and student needs (Byun, 2018).

Studying Entrepreneurship at UC is very interesting because it is taught directly by business practitioners who not only teach theory but are accompanied by other exciting practices and methods. The core of the entrepreneurship education method is students' ability to practice entrepreneurship, including starting businesses as coursework, serious games and simulations, design - based thinking, and reflective practice (Neck & Patricia, 2019).

One of the theories said that a practical education in universities conducted involving various components such as components of integrity (vision, mission, goals, and objectives), elements of students (input criteria, admissions, and graduate profiles), components of teachers and supporting staff (criteria, selection system, teacher profiles and the expected supporting staff, and staff development pattern), components of curriculum (substance, relevance, and sequence), details of implementation (governance). These include value system, management system, infrastructure components (physical infrastructure) that include infrastructure and facilities, parts of financial including sources of funding, funds allocation system, management, and accountability, as well as system component information which provides for system and policy dissemination of information.

UC has the curriculum policy entrepreneurship days and has run a framework for entrepreneurship education. But being that kind of university, it can not only be on the condition of a running framework for effective entrepreneurship education but also the policies issued by the government (in this case, the Indonesian government) should be considered. Referring to Law No. 12 of 2012, article 35 states that UC still needs to fully implement a higher education curriculum based on national higher education standards. It is indicated by lecturers still not following national higher education standards (it has no minimum educational qualification).

CONCLUSION

From the results description of the research and discussion, conclusions that refer to the problems and research questions can be drawn. This study concluded that the characteristics of lecturers who support entrepreneurship education are a collaboration between practitioners with academics. Lecturers who teach entrepreneurship education should have experience in the field, both in academics and practice. Lecturers who teach entrepreneurship education can also be called facilitators. Besides having expertise in their areas, these facilitators must also have the characteristics of an entrepreneur and be able to transmit and teach the spirit of entrepreneurship practically.

4. RECOMMENDATION

If entrepreneurship education is taught by lecturers full of academics, there tends to be little transmission of entrepreneurial spirit from lecturers to students. Or vice versa, if entrepreneurship education is taught by practitioners who are professionals in their fields but

do not have academic standards, for example, training in S1, but the lecturer also has an S1 education background, and some are even diploma graduates who are also less able to deliver theory. If only taught by academics, this kind of entrepreneurial education climate will give birth to theoretical scholars who are not practical. Hence, they tend not to be creative because they only learn from theory. Meanwhile, if taught by practitioners who do not have educational standards, it will result in the birth of undergraduate scholars who still need to have academic competency standards.

Based on the research and discussion description results, the author proposes general recommendations which refer to the problem formulation and research questions and requests related to further research, as summarized below. Suggestions offered by the author related to the characteristics of the lecturer is that to produce effective entrepreneurship education, one should set the qualifications standard and competence of lecturers, which should be incorporated into a policy. Lecturers should also have the academic qualifications and experience professionally, and if necessary, bring lecturers from across the country to enrich the material so that the graduates will be comfortable competing at the international level since they are used to international lecturers. Combining lecturers with academic qualifications by standards and practitioner lecturers who have businesses will be more effective in producing an entrepreneur.

5. REFERENCES

- Alain Fayolle (2013) Personal views on the future of entrepreneurship education, *Entrepreneurship & Regional Development*, 25:7-8, 692-701, DOI: 10.1080/08985626.2013.821318
- Andreas Fejes, Mattias Nylund & Jessica Wallin (2019) How do teachers interpret and transform entrepreneurship education?, *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 51:4, 554-566, DOI: 10.1080/00220272.2018.1488998
- Anoosheh Sherkat & Alireza Chenari (2022) Assessing the effectiveness of entrepreneurship education in the universities of Tehran province based on an entrepreneurial intention model, *Studies in Higher Education*, 47:1, 97-115, DOI: 10.1080/03075079.2020.1732906
- Antara News, Harian. (2012). *Berita Nasional, Umum*, 18 Desember 2012, "Menristek Nyatakan Daya Saing Indonesia Menurun". [Online]. Tersedia: <http://www.antaraneews.com/berita/349075/menristek-nyatakan-daya-saing-indonesia-menurun>
- Antara News, Harian. (2013). "Penerimaan CPNS Digelar Agustus 2013". [Online]. Tersedia: <http://fileindowebster475.blogspot.com/2013/05/tes-penerimaan-cpns-digelar-agustus-2013.html>
- Bécharde J.-P., Grégoire D. (2005) Entrepreneurship education research revisited: The case of higher education. *Academy of Management Learning & Education* 4: 22–43.

- Berglund K., Verduyn K. (2018) Revitalizing entrepreneurship education: Adopting a critical approach in the classroom, London, England: Routledge.
- Byun.G, Sung.S, Park. And Choi. (2018). A Study on the Effectiveness of Entrepreneurship Education Programs in Higher Education Institutions: A Case Study of Korean Graduate Programs. *Journal of Oppen Innovation: Technology, market, and complexity*.
- Catherine Ann Doherty (2010) Doing business: knowledge in the internationalised business lecture, *Higher Education Research & Development*, 29:3, 245-258, DOI: 10.1080/07294360903470951.
- Chux G. Abdullah O. Entrepreneurship education, curriculum and lecturer-competency as antecedents of student entrepreneurial intention. *The International Journal of management education*. Vol 19 Issue 1 March 2021.
- Ciputra, Tanan & Waluyo (2011). *Ciputra Quantum Leap 2*. Jakarta: PT Gramedia.
- Cope J., Watts G. (2000) Learning by doing – An exploration of experience, critical incidents and reflection in entrepreneurial learning. *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour & Research* 6: 104–124.
- Detik News. (2007). "70 Ribu Pelamar Trans tv Ujian bak UMPTN di Senayan" [Online]. Tersedia : <http://news.detik.com/read/2007/01/21/154114/732831/10/70-ribu-pelamar-trans-tv-ujian-bak-umptn-di-senayan>.
- Dwita, F., Elliyana, E., & Surapto, D. (2022). The Effect of Human Capital and Entrepreneurship on Lecture Performance (University Entrepreneurship Supporting Lecturer in Indonesia). *Jurnal Manajemen Bisnis Dan Kewirausahaan*, 6(4), 457–462. <https://doi.org/10.24912/jmbk.v6i4.18191>
- Engkoswara dan Komariah, A. (2010). *Administrasi Pendidikan*. Bandung: Alfabeta
- Gozum, A. G. (2012). ANALYZING THE ENTREPRENEURIAL QUALIFICATIONS OF ENTREPRENEURSHIP STUDENTS: A STUDY ON THE ENTREPRENEURSHIP LECTURE PARTICIPANTS OF A BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION DEPARTMENT. *International Journal of Business and Management Studies*, 4 (1), 11-20. Retrieved from <https://dergipark.org.tr/en/pub/ijbms/issue/26066/274615>
- Fatima Sirelkhatim & Yagoub Gangi | Tahir Nisar (Reviewing Editor) (2015) Entrepreneurship education: A systematic literature review of curricula contents and teaching methods, *Cogent Business & Management*, 2:1, DOI: 10.1080/23311975.2015.1052034
- Handriani, E. (2011). *Pengembangan Kualitas Pendidikan Kewirausahaan di Perguruan Tinggi*, *Jurnal Ilmiah Inkoma*, Volume 22, Nomor 1, Fakultas Ekonomi Undaris Ungaran
- Heidi M. Neck & Patricia G Entrepreneurship Education: Known Worlds and New Frontiers. Pages 55-70 | Published online: 21 Nov 2019—*Journal of Small Business Management*.
- Hisrich, R.D., Peter. M.P & Shepherd. (2005). *D.A. Entrepreneurship 6/e*. New York: McGraw-Hill Irwin.

- Gibb, A. (2011). *Concepts into practice: Meeting the challenge of development of entrepreneurship educators around an innovative paradigm*, The case of the International Entrepreneurship Educators' Programme (IEEP). *International Journal of Entrepreneurial Behaviour & Research*.17, (2), 146-165.". [Online]. Tersedia: www.emeraldinsight.com/1355-2554.htm
- Kuratko, D.F (2005). The Emergence of Entrepreneurship Education: Development, Trends, and Challenges. *Entrepreneurship Theory and Practice*.29, (5), 577-598.
- Kuratko, D.F (2009). *Introduction To Entrepreneurship*, 8th ed. South Western.
- Lin, S. and Xu, Z. (2017), "The factors that influence the development of entrepreneurship education: Based on the case of China," *Management Decision*, Vol. 55 No. 7, pp. 1351-1370. <https://doi.org/10.1108/MD-06-2016-0416>
- Linton, G., Klinton, M. University entrepreneurship education: a design thinking approach to learning. *J Innov Entrep* 8, 3 (2019). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13731-018-0098-z>
- Mwsalwiba, E.S. (2010). Entrepreneurship Education: a review of its Objectives, teaching methods and impact indicators. *Education + Training*. 52,(1),20-47. [Online]. Tersedia: www.emeraldinsight.com/0040-0912.htm
- Miles, M.B. & Huberman, A.M. (1994). *Qualitative Data Analysis* (2nd ed.). California: Thousand Oaks, Sage Publication, Inc.
- Morris, M.H. (2017), "Why Content and Lecture Matter in Entrepreneurship Education," *The Great Debates in Entrepreneurship* (Advances in the Study of Entrepreneurship, Innovation, and Economic Growth, Vol. 27), Emerald Publishing Limited, Bingley, pp. 1-8. <https://doi.org/10.1108/S1048-473620170000027002>
- Nathalie Duval - council (2013) *Assessing the Impact of Entrepreneurship Education Programs: Challenges and Approaches*, *Journal of Small Business Management*, 51:3, 394-409, DOI: 10.1111/jsbm.12024
- Nugroho, R.L. (2012). *Pendidikan Entrepreneurship Di Perguruan Tinggi*. Bandung: Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia.
- Pearce,II, J, Robinson,R.B. (1996). *Manajemen Strategik. Formulasi, Implementasi, dan Pengendalian*. Jakarta. Binarupa Akasara.
- Republika On Line. (2012). Umum, Berita Nasional, 12 September 2012, Kemenpora : Pengangguran Terdidik Capai 47,81 Persen [Online]. Tersedia:<http://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/umum/12/09/12/ma8dl2kemenpora-pengangguran-terdidik-capai-4781-persen>
- Republika On Line. (2012). Umum, Berita Nasional, 3 Desember 2012, Banyak Pengangguran Terdidik Karena Sarjana Bermental Akademik [Online].Tersedia:<http://www.republika.co.id/berita/nasional/umum/12/12/03/megkng-banyak-pengangguran-terdidik-karena-sarjana-bermental-akademik>.

- Saranza, Cris & Bueno, Nina & Andrin, Glenn & Niñal, Melvin. (2022). Teachers' Entrepreneurial Competence and Teaching Methods in Entrepreneurship Education: A Basis for Teachers Training Curriculum
- Satori, D. dan Komariah, A. (2009). *Methodology Penelitian Kualitatif*. Bandung; Alfabeta.
- Solomon, G.T., Duffy, S. & Tarabishy, A. (2002). *The State of Entrepreneurship Education in The United States: A Nationwide Survey and Analysis*. *International Journal of Entrepreneurship Education*, Vol. 1 No. 1, pp. 1-22.
- Solomon, G.T. (2006). "USASBE White Paper Series: Are We Teaching Small Business Management to Entrepreneurs and Entrepreneurship to Small Business Managers?" [Online]. Tersedia :
- Solomon, G. (2007), "An examination of entrepreneurship education in the United States," *Journal of Small Business and Enterprise Development*, Vol. 14 No. 2, pp. 168-182. <https://doi.org/10.1108/14626000710746637>
- Sugiyono. (2010). *Metode Penelitian Pendidikan*. Bandung. Alfabeta.
- Suryadi, A. (2012). *Outlook 2025 Pembangunan Pendidikan Indonesia Menuju Kualitas yang Berdaya Saing Secara Global*. Badan Penelitian dan Pengembangan Kementerian Pendidikan dan Kebudayaan. Jakarta.
- Tobroni. (2010). "Manajemen dan Kepemimpinan Pendidikan Islam : Mencari Format Baru Manajemen yang Efektif di Era Globalisasi". [Online]. Tersedia: <http://tobroni.staff.umm.ac.id/2010/12/01/manajemen-dan-kepemimpinan-pendidikan-islam-mencariformat-baru-manajmen-yang-efektif-di-era-globalisasi>.
- Tribun News.com. (2013). "Muhaimin Iskandar: 600 Ribu Sarjana di Indonesia jadi Pengangguran" [Online]. Tersedia: <http://www.tribunnews.com/nasional/2013/11/03/muhaimin-iskandar-600-ribu-sarjana-di-indonesia-jadi-pengangguran> .
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 20 tahun 2003 tentang sistem Pendidikan Nasional.
- Undang-Undang Republik Indonesia Nomor 12 tahun 2012 tentang Pendidikan Tinggi.
- Wilson, Karen. (2006). "*Entrepreneurship Education in Europe: Fostering Entrepreneurial Mindsets Through Education and Learning*. Oslo; European Commission.
- World Economic Forum. (2009). *Educating the Next Wave of Entrepreneurs: Unlocking entrepreneurial capabilities to meet the global challenges of the 21st s of the 21st Century*. Switzerland: World Economic Forum.