Islamic educational psychology, critical analysis study of Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat's thinking

Muhammad Nurrosyid Huda Setiawan a,1, Fadhlurrahman b,c,2*, Marzuki d,3*, Endah Retnowati e,4*,

a Religious Studies Program, Universitas Darussalam Gontor, Indonesia
b Department of Islamic Education, Universitas Ahmad Dahlan, Indonesia
c Postgraduate Education Science, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia
d Citizenship and Law Education, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia
e Mathematics Education, Universitas Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Received: July 27, 2023 Revised: September 12, 2023 Accepted: October 15, 2023

KEYWORDS
Islamic educational, Psychology, Hamka, Zakiah Daradjat's, Critical analysis study

ABSTRACT

This research focuses on a comparative analysis of Islamic psychology education from the perspective of two great figures, namely Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat. Islamic psychology is a field that explores the human mind and behavior through an Islamic lens, combining principles from the Koran and Hadith. Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat are figures who have made significant contributions in this field. By examining their approach to education, curriculum design, teaching methods, assessment practices, and their overall impact and influence, this research aims to provide valuable insights into the field of Islamic psychology education and its relevance today. The research method used is literature with interpretive data analysis methods, pragmatic and holistic content analysis. Data validation using method triangulation and source triangulation. The results of this research focus specifically on the comparison of Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat in the context of Islamic psychology education. The scope includes their approach to education, curriculum design, teaching methods, assessment practices, and their overall impact on the field. This analysis will examine their individual contributions and highlight the similarities and differences between the two figures. In the theoretical study of these two figures, the results of educational approaches, curriculum design, teaching methods, assessment practices and their impact on the field emerge.

This is an open-access article under the CC-BY-SA license.

Introduction

Islamic educational psychology is very important in the field of Islamic education. It provides a dimension for the development of education with spiritual-divine characteristics (Pranajaya et al., 2023). The low spiritual level of the younger generation can be overcome through the role of Islamic educational psychology in developing children's spirituality (Akbar
Maulana et al., 2022). Islamic education plays an important role in the parenting perspective and is linked to the stages of child development and psychology (Suryana et al., 2023). The psychology of communication in Islamic educational activities is essential for expressing intentions and promoting harmony in life (Fajar et al., 2022). Educational psychology focuses on the application of psychology to bring about positive behavioural change, and it can be related to verses of the Qur’an (Hidayatullah, 2023). Overall, Islamic educational psychology contributes to the development of individuals, their spirituality, and their behaviour, emphasising the importance of Islamic values and teachings in education.

The study of religion and education in this area involves various initiatives and challenges. The Association for the Academic Study of New Religions is a non-profit organisation that supports research in new and minority religions (Benjamin E. Zeller, 2022). Religion and education are two areas that have been the subject of much debate. Some argue that studying religion in education is important for understanding historical events and the role of religion in society (Flensner, 2020). Others argue that there should be a distinction between religious studies and religious education, as they have different objectives and approaches (Parker et al., 2019). Feminist pedagogy has also been explored in the context of religious studies and religious education, challenging traditional content, methods, and objectives (Robinson & Cush, 2018). Moreover, the fields of religion and education are seen as distinct interdisciplinary fields of enquiry, with different methodological perspectives informing them (Philip Barnes, 2015). In the context of the Middle East conflict and related topics, teachers in religious education and social studies classes use a variety of pedagogical approaches, including avoidance, denial, provocation, representing multiple perspectives, and eliciting empathy (Lewin, 2021). Overall, the study of religion in education is complex and requires consideration of a wide range of perspectives and objectives.

In contrast, Hamka’s Islamic education thought in Indonesia emphasises the importance of strengthening national values and collective consciousness through Islamic education. Hamka’s concept of education (Zul, 2021) includes five main components: educators, subject matter, educational methods, students, and educational goals. Islamic education, according to Hamka, must have a flexible approach based on wisdom, mautidzah hasanah, and Mujadalah (Rengga Irfan, 2022). In addition, Hamka’s psychotherapeutic approach in Islamic education focuses on self-purification, self-identification or understanding, and self-development, which are derived from empirical and prophetic-based experiences. Hamka’s Islamic education is based on prophetic education and aims to provide students with a holistic understanding of themselves (Farida et al., 2019) and their existence, as well as developing their prophetic potential and intelligence. Hamka’s application of psychotherapy in Islamic education is rooted
in the Qur’an and Sunnah, with the aim of achieving holistic health and applying divine and humanistic values in Islamic education.

Islamic psychology education is discussed in the abstracts of several journal articles. While Hamka is not mentioned in any abstracts, Zakiah Daradjat is mentioned in one. Zakiah Daradjat promotes the integration of Islamic sacred sources, Muslim psycho-spiritual traditions, and advances in modern European psychology into a new form of knowledge that can address the challenges brought by modernity. She advocates the relevance of religiously orientated psychology in the Southeast Asian context as a diagnostic tool to transform and enliven the Muslim mind to create a morally driven and divinely conscious society (Pranajaya et al., 2023). Until the great contribution in this research in the field of Islamic educational psychology today, an in-depth study and critical analysis of Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat's thoughts.

Method

In this study, researchers used a library-type research methodology Library Research (Hadi, 2014). The method or approach used is about the ideas, concepts or ideas of a character in his work (CHOLILY, 2018). Data analysis method (Baharun & Mundiri, 2011) used in analysing data; Interpretation by trying to achieve a correct understanding of facts, data and symptoms. Pragmatic Content Analysis (Krippendorff, 2020), This is the procedure of understanding texts by classifying signs according to their causes or effects that may arise, and Holistika with a person’s mind is not seen from atomistic, both between aspects of his thinking and in his interaction with all the reality that surrounds him data validity by using source triangulation and method triangulation techniques (Sutopo, 2002).

Fig 1. Research Method Flow

The application of source triangulation by collecting various sources including books, journals, magazines, electronic newspapers and so on. While the application of method
triangulation, this research uses 2 mutually reinforcing methods, namely phenomenology and maudu'i. The method of drawing conclusions using the deductive method. That is, drawing a conclusion on the basis of theoretical data for a special conclusion of facts (Surahmad, 2004). By using this method, it is hoped that the final conclusion is the result of research that is objective and can be accounted for.

Results and Discussion

Hamka (Haji Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah) and Zakiah Daradjat are two prominent figures in Islamic scholarship, and while they have made significant contributions to Islamic thought, they do not specifically fall under the category of Islamic psychology education. Both Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat have focused on a wide range of Islamic disciplines, including theology, jurisprudence, and social issues (Indra Johari, 2021).

Hamka's Background Hamka was an Indonesian Islamic scholar, philosopher and writer who lived from 1908 to 1981. He was a prolific writer and played an important role in intellectual and religious development in Indonesia. Hamka's works cover various aspects of Islamic science, including theology, exegesis of the Qur’an (Tafsir), and social issues. He stressed the need for balance between religious and scientific knowledge, and advocated a holistic approach to education. Literary Works: One of his famous literary works is the novel "Tenggelamnya Kapal Van Der Wijck," which not only raises social issues but also explores psychology and human emotions.

Zakiah Daradjat is an Indonesian Muslim scholar, known for his contributions to Islamic thought and education. He was born in 1928 and was actively involved in academic and educational activities. Zakiah Daradjat's contributions focus on various aspects of Islamic education and women's issues. He has written extensively on Islamic psychology, ethics, and social concerns from an Islamic perspective. His works often emphasize the importance of character development and ethical behavior.

Zakiah Daradjat is famous for her defense of women's rights within the framework of Islamic teachings. She has explored Islamic feminism and the role of women in society, contributing to discussions regarding gender issues from an Islamic perspective.

Although Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat both made valuable contributions to Islamic thought, they had different focuses within the broader spectrum of Islamic studies. Hamka's works cover a variety of topics, including literature and social issues, while Zakiah Daradjat concentrates on Islamic education, ethics, and women's issues. Hamka and Zakia Daradjat's aspects of Islamic psychology education are strengthened by the works of scholars who have studied this field more deeply, such as Ibn Sina (Avicenna) or Al-Ghazali, who have discussed...
aspects of psychology in Islam as the basis of intellectual tradition.

Islamic psychology is a field that seeks to intertwine Islamic principles and beliefs with psychology principles to provide a holistic approach to mental health and well-being. Two prominent figures in the field of Islamic psychology are Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat. While both individuals have contributed significantly to the development of Islamic psychology, they have distinct approaches and perspectives.

Hamka, also known as Haji Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah, was an Indonesian Islamic scholar, writer, and politician. He emphasized the importance of incorporating Islamic teachings and values into psychology to better understand human behavior and address mental health issues. In his works, such as "Tafsir al-Azhar" and "Tasawuf Modern," he explored various aspects of Islamic psychology, including the role of spirituality, self-discipline, and self-awareness in achieving inner peace and well-being. Hamka argued that a deep understanding of Islamic teachings and spiritual practices is essential for individuals to attain psychological stability and resilience.

On the other hand, Zakiah Daradjat, an Indonesian psychologist and academician, focused on integrating Western psychology theories with Islamic principles. She argued that Islamic psychology should not be seen as a separate discipline but rather as a comprehensive framework that incorporates the insights of both Western and Islamic psychology. She believed that by combining the universal principles of psychology with Islamic teachings, one could provide effective solutions for mental health issues. In her works, such as "Psychology from an Islamic Perspective," she explored various psychological concepts, including personality development, cognitive processes, and psychotherapy, from an Islamic standpoint.

While both Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat made valuable contributions to the field of Islamic psychology, their approaches differ. Hamka emphasized the need to prioritize Islamic teachings and spiritual practices as the foundation for psychological well-being. In contrast, Zakiah Daradjat advocated for a blending of Western psychology theories with Islamic principles to provide a comprehensive approach to understanding and addressing mental health issues.

Method of Islamic Education According to Hamka

In carrying out the process of Islamic Education, the method is one of the most critical aspects; besides that, the technique is a supporting factor for a teacher in delivering his learning material. If a teacher provides the wrong method, it hampers the teaching and learning process, wasting time. This leads to the technique that has been done by the Prophet Muhammad. And the Qur’an also explains how to teach and educate children properly.
According to Hamka, Education, and teaching are different things but must be balanced and hand in hand; he said Education leads to the formation of attitudes, while teaching leads to the knowledge that must be mastered.

According to Knox, a method is a way of proceeding in a planned and organised manner in order to achieve a particular goal (Khamsi & Asiah, 2021). When associated with the word education or teaching, Omar Muhammad Al-Touny Al-Syaibany (Hidayat et al., 2021) It means the activities that teachers carry out in a planned manner with the aim of the lessons they teach can see the developmental characteristics of their students and the natural atmosphere around them and help their students to achieve the desired learning process so as to produce the desired changes in their behavior. Islam is a religion that honors knowledge. The Prophet Muhammad SAW descended to this earth and revealed the holy book of the Qur’an and taught various kinds of knowledge because Islam has the aim of keeping people away from ignorance. So, it can be concluded that the method is a way of delivering teaching to students in a planned manner so as to produce progress in achieving the learning process.

Starting from the above problems, Haji Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah (HAMKA) provides a bright spot for the problems that occur, which is contained in the book Al-Azhar Tafsir Volume V, some of his methods based on the Qur’an in Surah An-Nahl verse 125:

ادْعُ إِلَىٰ سَيْبِيلِ رَبِّكَ بِالْحَكْمَةِ وَالْمَوْعِظَةِ الْخَبِيسَةِ ۖ وَجَادِلُ ۖ وَجَادِلُ بِالَّتِي هِيَ أَحْسَنُ ۚ إِنَّ رَبِّكَ هُوَ أَعْلَمُ بِمَنْ ضَلَّ عَن صِبْرِهِ ۖ وَهُوَ أَعْلَمُ بِالْمُهْتَدِينِ [۶۱:۵۲]

Call (people) to the way of your Lord with wisdom and good lessons and argue with them in a good way. Verily, your Lord is the One who knows better who has strayed from His path and He is the One who knows better those who are guided.

The verse above contains the meaning of how the Apostleullah SAW teaches a person not to get lost and to always be on the right path. In line with what Hamka stated in the Book of Life, institutions, namely how to carry out instructions and teaching gradually, with wisdom leading to people who do not know, with mau’izah leading to someone who already knows but is negligent, and mujadalah which means exchanging ideas leading to someone who feels his stance is right even though it is wrong.

1. Hikmah (wisdom) method

Wisdom according to language is putting something in its place, which is a virtue given by Allah SWT. to humans so that they can control their desires and anger, not to wander (Khamsi & Asiah, 2021). Hamka compares the meaning of the hadith above to a tree. Namely, the branch is a community, and the tree is its community. Members of the society are like branches, and
branches will only be vital if they are fertile where they depend namely trees. However, the tree itself cannot feel the air exchange if the branches are exhausted. The wood that someone cuts off some of its branches will not come back to life because no air door will enter to flow through him. Hamka suggests the mau'izhatul hasanah method is good teaching or note and delivered with advice. As education demands since childhood, parental education at home to children, through modeling religious activities in front of children, it becomes their life as well. It also includes education and teaching in college.

2. Mujadalah Method (Discussion)

Hamka argues that the mujadalah method is an arrangement of efforts to exchange ideas between personal opinions and other people's opinions (Jannah, 2017). If there is an argument, refute it with good language, but if you cannot avoid it, choose the best way, such as separating the conversation from your feelings of hatred or favoritism towards the person you are arguing with. For example, when a kufr (non-believer) does not understand the teachings of Islam, then at will he hurls insults at Islam because he is ignorant. Such a person must be warned kindly, admonished, and persuaded to think the right way so that he agrees. However, when his heart is hurt first by the wrong way we warn him, he will likely find it hard to accept the truth, even if his heart recognizes it because it has been hurt.

3. Observation Method

The observation method was also used by Haji Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah (HAMKA), with the intention of conveying an understanding of tawhid to students. According to Haji Abdul Malik Karim Amrullah (Gustiani, 2019) (HAMKA) it is a process of knowing God that is initiated and endeavoured according to each belief and ability, for example by looking at nature, multiplying knowledge, and studying the attributes of God. While learners know the attributes of God, this will make it easier and stimulate them to accept thoughts about God. so that they get closer to Him. Therefore, it is important to convey to learners that the attributes of God are all-good, all-merciful, all-loving, and others so as to stimulate learners to a sense of security.
Islamic Psychology in the Thought of Zakiah Daradjat

The term Islamic psychology in Indonesia has been known since the 1970s, first introduced by Prof. Dr. Zakiah Daradjat and Prof. Dr. A. Mukti Ali, especially in IAIN and other Islamic universities. According to Zakiah Daradjat, Islamic psychology is a science that examines the influence of religion on a person's attitudes and behavior or the mechanism that works within a person concerning the way of thinking, behaving, reacting, and acting, which is inseparable from his beliefs, because the belief is still in the construct of his personality. According to Zakiah Daradjat, the distinguishing aspect between contemporary psychology and Islamic psychology lies in the formulation of the human concept and its approach. Contemporary psychology only relies on intellectual abilities to find and uncover psychological principles, while Islamic psychology approaches it by functioning with reason and faith at once. Furthermore, Zakiah Daradjat revealed that the scope of contemporary psychology is only limited to three dimensions, namely the physical-biological dimension, the psychological dimension, and the sociocultural dimension. Meanwhile, Islamic psychology also includes the spiritual and spiritual dimension, which is taboo and never touched by contemporary psychology due to differences in foundation. This is where Islamic psychology will meet with Sufism later. Zakiah Daradjat explained her opinion regarding the definition of psychology itself. There are several definitions of Islamic psychology, according to Zakiah Daradjat (Nunzairina, 2018):

1. Islamic psychology is a science that talks about humans, especially human personality in the nature of philosophy, theory, methodology, and problem approaches based on formal Islamic sources (Al-Quran and Hadith), reason, senses, and intuition (Hairina & Mubarak, 2020).

2. Islamic psychology is a modern concept of psychology that has been filtered and contains Islamic insights (Inayatul Khanifah et al., n.d.).

3. Islamic psychology is an Islamic perspective on modern psychology by discarding concepts that are incompatible or contrary to Islam (Asrowi, 2020; Fadhilah, 2018; Sarlin Ampuno, 2020).

4. Islamic psychology is the science of humans whose conceptual framework is truly built with the spirit of Islam and based on formal sources (Al-Quran and Hadith) which are built by fulfilling scientific requirements (Adi Kurniawan, 2022).

5. Islamic psychology is a style of psychology based on the image of man according to Islamic teachings, which studies the uniqueness and patterns of human behaviour.
as an expression of interaction with oneself and the spiritual realm with the aim of improving mental health and the quality of religiousness (Agus Handoko, 2021).

Islamic psychology according to Zakiah Daradjat is closely related to Islamic education. He pointed out that the occurrence of unusual phenomena in the world of Indonesian education indicates a mental disorder (Tanjung & Cucu Setiawan, 2022) (mental health disorders) that occur in the majority of Indonesian society. These mental disorders are not caused by organic damage to the body, but because the mental condition feels depressed, disappointed, anxious, anxious, and so on (Iwan Janu Kurniawan, 2012).

Therefore, this is where religion and Islamic education play an important role, namely to overcome the problems of mental disorders. According to Zakiah (Yatim Pujiati, 2018), Religion has a fundamental role in understanding the essence of the human psyche. The influence of religious beliefs believed by a person will have implications for his behavior. Therefore, religion can be used as a basis for psychology. Then, the path of Islamic education related to guidance, direction, teaching, and coaching for students who will start from the family environment will be discussed.

The explanation proves the interrelationship between Islamic education and religious psychology. In this case, the psychology of religion is used to convey the vision and mission of Islamic education. The psychology of religion also has a vital role in mental health by examining, examining, studying, and studying the influence of religion on a person's attitudes and behavior or the mechanisms that work within a person, because the way of thinking, behaving, and reacting and behaving cannot be separated from his beliefs, because beliefs are categorized in the construction of his personality. That way, someone will avoid the symptoms of mental disorders and mental illness.

In this case, religion has a very urgent role that serves as a therapy for a restless and disturbed soul and as a preventive tool against the possibility of mental disorders. Because religion provides various guidelines and instructions to obtain peace of mind and life guidance in all fields. Islamic education is the path taken to guide, direct, educate, and foster students, especially for students who experience mental disorders. According to Zakiah Daradjat (Heni, 2017) Mental health is the realisation of true harmony between psychological functions and the creation of self-adjustment between humans and themselves and their environment, based on faith and piety, and aims to achieve a meaningful life that is happy in this world and the hereafter. Zakiah Daradjat argues that mental health is a form of personification of one's faith and piety (Abu Bakar, 2013). It is understood that all mental health criteria formulated must refer to the values of faith and piety.

When mental health talks about personality integrity, self-realisation, self-actualisation,
self-adjustment, and self-control, then the parameters must refer to faith and piety, creed, and sharia. Zakiah Daradjat argues that there are four indicators of mental health (Syamsu Yusuf, 2004) that can be used to see a person’s level of mental health, namely:

1. When a person can avoid mental disorders (Neurosis) and illness (psychoses).
2. When one can adjust to society, nature, and God.
3. When one can control oneself against all the problems and circumstances of daily life.
4. When there is harmony and harmony between psychological functions.

![Image of four indicators of mental health]

**Fig 3.** Four indicators of a person's mental health level according to Zakiah Daradjat

With these indicators, a person can easily measure his mental health behavior, assuming that the more the four indicators are fulfilled, the higher one’s mental health level, and vice versa. For this reason, Zakiah Daradjat calls "the discussion of mental health with four indicators" with the term "mental health as a person's psychological condition." In addition, there are two terms: mental health as science and mental health as psychiatric therapy or a form of psychotherapy.

In determining one's personality style, there are several essential elements, namely values taken from the environment, especially the family environment. The values in question are religious, moral, and social values. Among the three values, religious values are positive and permanent and do not change. Meanwhile, social and moral values based on something other than religion will often change with the development of society itself. Therefore, the mentality (personality) only fostered by social and moral values will likely change, and the shock will lead to mental shock if there is a change. Thus, someone who experiences mental shock will tend to have a greater chance of experiencing mental health disorders. Islamic psychology, in the view of Zakiah Daradjat, has a very close relationship with Islamic education and mental health. Islamic psychology is an approach in Islamic education to facilitate the vision and mission of implementing Islamic education itself. Islamic psychology is also used to minimize situations that should not occur in the world of education today, such as the denial of a student to his teacher and others. It is used to create humans with good mental health, namely humans who act according to the teachings of the religion they believe in.
Conclusion

In conclusion, both Hamka and Zakiah Daradjat have significantly contributed to the field of Islamic psychology. Their works offer different perspectives on how Islamic teachings and principles can be integrated into psychology to enhance mental health and well-being. By appreciating and studying their viewpoints, professionals in the field can better understand the nuances of Islamic psychology and utilize it to benefit individuals seeking psychological support within an Islamic framework.

Declarations

Author contribution: Fadhlurrahman is responsible for the entire research project. He also led the writing of the script and collaboration with a second author. Muhammad Nurrosyid Huda Setiawan participated in data collection, transcription, and analysis. He also revised the manuscript. Both authors approved the final manuscript.

Funding statement: No funding was made available for this research.

Conflict of interest: The authors declare no conflict of interest.

Additional information: No additional information is available for this paper.

References


Iwan Janu Kurniawan. (2012). PEMIKIRAN PROF. DR. ZAKIAH DARADJAT TENTANG PENDIDIKAN ISLAM DALAM PERSPEKTIF PSIKOLOGI AGAMA. UNIVERSITAS MUHAMMADIYAH SURAKARTA.


